

10/9

**DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES  
PUBLIC HEALTH SERVICE  
CENTERS FOR DISEASE CONTROL AND PREVENTION**

**Minutes of Meeting**

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON IMMUNIZATION PRACTICES**

**October 6-7, 1993**

**Atlanta, Georgia**

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON IMMUNIZATION PRACTICES**  
**Centers for Disease Control and Prevention**  
**Auditorium A**  
**October 6-7, 1993**

**OCTOBER 6**

8:00 AM	Introduction Additional Charge to ACIP	Dr. S. K... Dr. W. O...nstein
8:30 AM	Varicella Statement	Dr. S. H...nes
10:15 AM	<b>BREAK</b>	
10:30 AM	Review of Antiviral Recommendations for Influenza Update on Status of Licensure of Rimantadine Review of Antiviral Resistance to Amantadine and Rimantadine	Dr. N. A...en Dr. N. C...
11:30 AM	Update on the ACIP Recommendation for Meningococcal Vaccines	Dr. J. W...ger
12:00 AM	<b>LUNCH</b>	
1:00 PM	Emergence of Drug Resistance Pneumococcal Infections in the United States: Need for Aggressive Vaccination Promotion	Dr. R. B...man
1:30 PM	Adverse Consequences of Vaccines Other than Pertussis and Rubella	Dr. K. S...tton Institut...of Medicine
2:45 PM	Injury Compensation Update	Mr. T. B...ier NVICP
3:00 PM	<b>BREAK</b>	
3:15 PM	Vaccine Liberalization of Measles Timing of First Dose from 12-15 Months	Dr. L. M...kowitz
4:00 PM	Recommendation for Use of BCG Vaccine	Dr. R. H...bner
5:00 PM	Cost Benefit of Childhood Vaccinations	Dr. S. H...ler

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON IMMUNIZATION PRACTICES**  
**Centers for Disease Control and Prevention**  
**Auditorium A**  
**October 6-7, 1993**

**OCTOBER 7**

- |          |   |   |
|----------|---|---|
| 8:15 AM  | <b>The President's New Immunization Initiative</b>  | <b>Dr. D.A. J. Anderson</b><br>HHS  |
| 8:45 AM  | <b>Update on the National Vaccine Program</b>   | <b>Dr. A. Robbins</b><br>NVP  |
| 9:15 AM  | <b>Simplifying the Schedule Regarding the Third Dose of OPV</b>   | <b>Dr. R. Surber</b><br><b>Dr. P. Wright</b><br>Vanderbilt Univ.  |
| 10:00 AM | <b>BREAK</b>  |   |
| 10:20 AM | <b>Need for 4th Dose DTP Vaccine at 15-18 months</b>  | <b>Dr. N. Be...</b><br>PHLS, London<br><b>Dr. J. Cherry</b><br>UCLA<br><b>Dr. S. L...</b><br>St. Christopher's Hosp.<br><b>Dr. P. St...</b><br><b>Dr. R. Surber</b> |
| 12:00 PM | <b>Summary of FDA Workshops on "Combined Vaccines...." and "Harmonization of Reporting of Adverse Events Following Vaccination"</b> | <b>Dr. C. Hallegree</b><br>FDA  |
| 12:30 PM | <b>Public Comment</b>   |   |
| 12:45 PM | <b>ADJOURN</b>  |   |

**ATTENDEES:**

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Dr. Samuel L. Katz, Chairman  
Dr. Mary Lou Clements  
Dr. Kathryn Edwards  
Dr. Neal Halsey  
Dr. Rudolph Jackson  
Dr. Carlos Ramirez-Ronda  
Dr. Fred Thompson  
Dr. Joel Ward

Ex Officio Members

Dr. Carolyn Hardegree (FDA)

Liaison Representatives

Dr. Marvin Amstey (ACOG)  
Dr. Pierce Gardner (ACP)  
Dr. Caroline B. Hall (AAP)  
Dr. Walter Hierholzer (HICPAC)  
Dr. Edward Mortimer, Jr. (AMA)  
Dr. Georges Peter (AAP)  
Dr. Gregory Poland, (AHA)  
Dr. David Scheiffle (NACI)  
Dr. Richard Zimmerman (AAFP)

Acting Executive Secretary

Dr. Walter Orenstein

Centers for Disease Control  
and Prevention

Office of the Director

Dr. Dixie Snider

Office of the General Counsel

Mr. Kevin Malone

Epidemiology Program Office

Dr. Han Choi  
Dr. Laura Fehrs

International Health Program  
Office

Dr. Joe H. Davis

National Center for Infectious  
Diseases

Dr. Nancy Arden  
Dr. Joseph Bresee  
Dr. George Carlone  
Dr. Nancy Cox  
Dr. Carmen Deseda  
Dr. Scott Dowell  
Penina Haber  
Dr. Jim Hughes  
Dr. Eric Mast  
Helen Regenery  
Dr. Steven Rosenthal  
David Shay

National Center for Injury Prevention  
Services

Rosamond Dewart  
Dr. Alan Hinman

National Immunization Program

Dr. William Atkinson  
Dr. Bob Chen  
Dr. Steve Cochi  
Dr. Vance Dietz  
Judy Gantt  
Dr. Jacqueline Gindler  
Dr. Dayla Guris  
Dr. Steve Hadler  
Dr. Kimberly Heath  
Dr. Sandra Holmes  
Dr. Sonja Hutchins  
Dr. Charles LeBaron  
Dr. Arthur Manoharan  
Dr. Lauri Markowitz  
Dr. Mark Papania  
Dr. Mary Reichler  
Dr. Peter Strebel  
Dr. Ray Strikas  
Dr. F. VanLoon  
Dr. Walter Williams

Office of Public Affairs

Anne Sims

**ATTENDEES CONTINUED:**

Department of Health and Human Services

Dr. D.A. Henderson

U.S. Public Health Service

Mr. Thomas E. Balbier, Jr.

Food and Drug Administration

Julia Barrett

Drusilla Burns

Carl Frasch

Dr. Donna Freeman

Karen Goldenthal

Dr. Philip Krause

Dr. Margaret Mitrane

Dr. Linda Teague

National Institutes of Health

Dr. R. Rabinovich

National Vaccine Program

Dr. Joel Breman

Navy Environmental Health Center

Dr. Robert Brawley

Army Surgeon General's Office

Vincent P. Fonseca

Others Present

Pamela Adkins, Merck Vaccine Division

Stephan Antonsson, Forest Labs

Dr. Norman Begg, London

Jill Chamberlin, Vaccine Bulletin

Dr. James D. Cherry, UCLA

Dr. Jeff Davis, Wisconsin Department of Health

Dr. Ruth Ann Dunn, Michigan Department of Public Health

Craig Engessen, Lederle-Praxis

Carol Esch, Merck Vaccine Division

John Forro, Wyeth-Ayerst

Steve Frandzel, Medical World News

Carol Frankel, Evans/Medeva

Dr. Anne Gershon, Columbia University

Elizabeth Gorr, Fox, Bennett and Turner

Dan Granoff, Chiron Corp.

Valerie H. Greenwood, Merck & Co., Inc.

M. Elizabeth Halloran, Emory University

Barbara Howe, SmithKline Beecham

Clifton Neil Irby, Christian Science Church

Kenneth Keen, Merck Vaccine Division

Robert Kohberger, Lederle Praxis

Dr. Saul Krugman, NYU Medical Center

Sally Kubertin, Pediatric News

Dr. Diana Lennon, New Zealand Public Health

Dr. Sarah Long, St. Christopher's Children's Hosp., Philadelphia

Lucinda Long, Lederle Praxis

Dan Mahore, Lederle Praxis Biologicals

Wayne Morges, Merck & Co., Inc.

Dr. David Nalin, MRL

Marjorie Nicholls, Forest Labs

Others Present continued

Lorraine Radick, Lederle-Praxis Biologicals  
Anne Rochel, Atlanta Journal and Constitution  
Marie Rosenthal, Infectious Diseases in Children  
Benjamin A. Rubin, Wyeth  
Dr. Stuart L. Scheiner, Forest Labs  
Dan Soland, SmithKline Beecham  
Dale R. Spriggs, VRI, Inc.  
Kathleen Stratton, Institute of Medicine  
Barbara Sweeney, NAPNAP  
Dr. T. R. Ubertini, North American Vaccine  
Jose Viarengo, Argentina Public Health Ministry  
Thomas Vernon, Merck Vaccine Division  
Ralph Vosdingh, Connaught Laboratories  
Diana Wance, Merck  
Dr. Jo White, Merck Research Laboratories

## Abstract

At the ACIP meeting convened at CDC on October 6-7, 1993, members critiqued ACIP draft statements on varicella, antiviral agents for influenza, and outbreak control for meningococcal vaccines. They voted on a proposed statement of recommended vaccines and schedules--a new requirement for the ACIP under the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1993. The group voted to alter the measles recommendation to allow a more permissive 12-15 month MMR vaccination nationwide; not to change the current DTP recommendations regarding the fourth dose; and to recommend giving the third dose of OPV on the same schedule as DTP, namely, at 6 months of age. A working group was created to evaluate and respond to a congressionally requested IOM report on adverse events associated with childhood vaccines. Other discussions and presentations are outlined in the Executive Summary and minutes, below.

## Executive Summary

On October 6-7, 1993, the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) convened at the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Dr. Samuel Katz, Chairperson, opened the meeting at 8:00 a.m. on October 6. Dr. Walter Orenstein was Acting Executive Secretary.

Dr. Katz introduced Dr. David Scheifele, the new liaison representative for the Canadian National Advisory Committee on Immunization; Dr. Walter Hierholzer, standing in for Dr. David Fleming for the Hospital Infection Control Practices Advisory Committee (HICPAC); Dr. Rick Zimmerman, from the University of Pittsburgh, representing Dr. Ron VanBuren for the American Academy of Family Physicians; Dr. Anthony Robbins from the National Vaccine Program; and Dr. Gregory Poland, from the Mayo Clinic, filling in for American Hospital Association liaison member Dr. William Schaffner.

ACIP members and liaison representatives introduced themselves. Following this, the 45-plus members of the audience introduced themselves. All members and liaison representatives announced their conflicts of interest.

Dr. Orenstein then explained the new Vaccines for Children Program. Under the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1993, the ACIP has the charge to determine the list of vaccines for routine administration to children under age 18 who receive vaccine through the Vaccines for Children Program, along with schedules regarding the appropriate periodicity, dosage, and contraindications applicable to the pediatric vaccines for this program. Dr. Orenstein said the ACIP needed to vote on a proposed list and schedule for pediatric vaccines that he recommends. Mr. Kevin Malone, from CDC's General Counsel Office, said he would prepare the draft of a motion on such a proposed list on which members could vote.

### Varicella Statement

Dr. Sandra Holmes, NIP, summarized responses to the revised comprehensive draft on varicella that had been circulated to ACIP members. Dr. Hardegree announced that the license application for varicella vaccine has been submitted to the FDA and that a review is under way.

Then Dr. Holmes led the ACIP through specific wording about key issues that were still undecided in the ACIP statement. Dr. Katz asked if committee members agreed that the general experience with mixing live and inactivated antigens together is that there has not been interference and that none is anticipated with the varicella vaccine, though more data and studies are needed. Members agreed with this wording. Dr. Holmes asked that any comments about the suggested tables or other matters be sent to her or Ms. Gloria Kovach in writing by October 27.



Dr. Katz presented the ACIP with a farewell gift, an antique engraved bell.

### Reye Syndrome Update

Drs. Joseph Bresee and Larry Schonberger, DVRD, NCID, updated the Committee on surveillance for Reye syndrome.

### Review of Antiviral Recommendations for Influenza

Dr. Nancy Arden, VR, NCID, said that influenza activity has started early this season and that CDC has recommended that vaccination programs be completed by the end of October.

Rimantadine was approved for marketing on September 17. The new draft of "ACIP Recommendations for the Prevention and Control of influenza, Part II. Antiviral Agents" contains more information on resistance, more specific and realistic information on prophylaxis, and more specific information on dosage and potential adverse reactions.

Dr. Nancy Cox, VR, NCID, reviewed international surveillance for prevalence of amantadine- and rimantadine-resistant viruses and reviewed the mechanisms of antiviral activity of the two drugs. A working group was created to handle the wording about the use of rimantadine with children. Its members are Dr. Clements and Dr. Hall and Dr. Donna Freeman from FDA.

### Update on the ACIP Recommendation for Meningococcal Vaccination

Dr. Jay Wenger, DBMD, NCID, briefly reviewed changes in the final draft in Part I of the two-part meningococcal ACIP recommendation. He asked if the committee was sure it wanted to retain Part II, which is new and devoted to outbreak control. The Committee indicated its overwhelming support" for this section. Dr. Katz urged that all comments on the draft be returned to Dr. Wenger or Ms. Kovach by October 2

### Emergence of Drug-Resistant Pneumococcal Infections in the United States: Need for Aggressive Vaccination Promotion

Next, Dr. Robert Breiman, BMD, NCID, discussed drug-resistant pneumococci. Many feel that once the proportion of resistant isolates in a community is higher than 5% for a serious infection, the same drug runs risks using that drug. If this is true, use of penicillin as a primary drug for empiric therapy of pneumococcal infection will soon pass. The same is probably true for trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole and erythromycin. There was discussion about the ACIP's publishing an article in the MMWR on this subject.

## Adverse Consequences of Vaccines Other than Pertussis and *belli*

Dr. Kay Stratton from the Institute of Medicine of the National Academy of Sciences updated the committee on a congressionally requested report on the adverse events associated with childhood vaccines. The draft report and an executive summary of it were released on September 14 and are now available through the National Academic Press.

Subsequent discussion showed that members were concerned about the lack of attributable risk of the adverse consequences, that is, to say, the fact that denominators were not given and that the frequency of such occurrences was not stated. A working group was created to evaluate the report, provide perspective and suggestions for further research, and advise about what information from the report should be incorporated into warnings and contraindications for vaccines. The group's members are Mr. Malone and Dr. Orenstein from CDC and Dr. Ward, Dr. Halsey, Dr. Clements, and Dr. Jackson from the ACIP.

## Injury Compensation Update

Mr. Tom Balbier of the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program updated the committee on this program to resolve claims resulting from adverse reactions to covered vaccines. The spending authority for post-1988 award payments from the vaccine compensation trust fund was permanently extended; there is no chance that the excise tax will end. The spending authority for the pre-1988 program has increased from \$80 million to \$110 million annually.

## Vaccines For Children Program--Continued

Mr. Malone rejoined the group and distributed a proposed statement that the ACIP could send forward to the Secretary of HHS regarding current vaccines (see Handout #1). It was suggested that the following preparations be added to the list: Td, DT, monovalent measles, OPV and IPV, combination products (DTP/haemophilus conjugate). Dr. Katz asked for a vote that the provision, as written by Mr. Malone, with the caveat that the ACIP will go through the list of currently recommended vaccines very carefully, be considered acceptable to the Committee. The vote was unanimous.

## Vaccine Liberalization of Measles Timing of First Dose from 12-15 Months

Dr. Lauri Markowitz, NIP, discussed the liberalization of the measles schedule to increase vaccine coverage in young children. She reviewed the reasons for reconsidering the recommended age of vaccination to include children down to 12 months, and detailed five sources of data supporting the early susceptibility to measles of U.S. children.

She said that the ACIP had three possible actions to consider: 1) leave the recommendations as they are now, pending further data in response to MMR vaccine at 12 and 15 months of age; 2) change the recommended age

for MMR nationwide to 12 months; and 3) or alter recommendations to allow a more permissive 12-month MMR vaccination nationwide. The vote was unanimous for the third recommendation. Dr. Markowitz will prepare a succinct summary of her presentation for the MMWR. A paragraph would be added that articulates the ACIP recommendation.

### Cost Benefit of Childhood Vaccinations

Dr. Steve Hadler, NIP, gave Dr. E. Hatziaandreau's summary collaborative work to reexamine the benefits and costs of immunizations. For DTP analyses, \$7 is saved in direct costs for every \$1 spent. For MMR, the direct costs are \$15-\$20 saved for every dollar spent. For polio, almost \$4 is saved for every dollar spent. CDC/Batelle childhood s for every very dollar .

Dr. Katz adjourned the meeting for the day at 5:30 p.m. He opened the meeting again on October 7 at 8:15.

### The President's New Immunization Initiative

Dr. D.A. Henderson, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health-ience, discussed the President's new immunization initiative, for which Dr. Henderson has responsibility.

### Update on the National Vaccine Program

Dr. Anthony Robbins discussed personnel changes in the National Vaccine Program. He announced a new subcommittee, led by Dr. Barr Bloom, to determine future vaccine needs of the country and to enter into open dialogue with manufacturers. He then briefly discussed his program's work with CDC, HCFA, and the National Governors Association in getting the Vaccines for Children program off the ground.

### Simplifying the Schedule on Third Dose of OPV

Next, Dr. Peter Wright of Vanderbilt University reviewed epidemiology, immunogenicity and long-term antibody persistence data that suggest that OPV3 can be given safely and effectively at 6 months of age. Following a brief discussion, Dr. Katz asked for a vote of ACIP members about whether they endorsed publishing a recommendation that makes it the custom to give OPV on the same schedule as DTP, namely, at 2, 4, and 6 months. The motion passed.

### Dates for 1994 ACIP Meetings

Dr. Katz announced the following dates for 1994: February 13-24 and October 19-20. June was still undecided. [Note: June 29-30 has now been agreed upon.] Ms. Kovach will resolve the June dates and inform members.

## Need for a Fourth Dose of DTP Vaccine at 15-18 Months

Dr. Hadler asked the ACIP to consider the need for a fourth dose of DTP at 15 to 18 months of age. Dr. Sarah Long from St. Christopher's Hospital in Philadelphia discussed DTP immunogenicity; Dr. Peter Strebler, NIP, presented data on effectiveness; Dr. Steve Renthal, NIP, gave perspectives on the safety of the fourth dose; Dr. Norman Begg, a consultant epidemiologist with the Public Health Laboratory Service in London, shared the U.K. pertussis experience with a 2-, 3- and 4-month DTP schedule; and Dr. James Cherry from UCLA gave perspectives on the immunogenicity of pertussis vaccines and perspectives on the U.K. and U.S. experiences with them.

Dr. Roland Sutter, NIP, then presented three options for the ACIP to decide on regarding DTP: 1) make no change in current DTP recommendations; 2) discard the recommendation for a fourth dose of DTP; and 3) de-emphasize the fourth dose, but continue with doses 4 and 5 as boosters. The ACIP members voted unanimously for no change.

## Summary of Two FDA Workshops

Dr. Hardegree read a summary on the International Workshop on Combined Vaccines and Simultaneous Administration, prepared by FDA's Dr. Drusilla Burns (Handout #2).

Dr. Hardegree also summarized CEPR's "Harmonization of Reporting of Adverse Events Following Vaccination," held the week before in Bethesda and sponsored by NIH, NVPO, WHO and others. Some national monitoring and surveillance programs have been started or are being set up.

Dr. Katz invited public comments; there were none. He then thanked everyone and adjourned the meeting at 12:25 p.m.

A summary of agreed-upon actions follows the full minutes. On October 6-7, 1993, the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) convened at the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) to discuss the status of numerous vaccine-preventable diseases and vaccine-related issues. Dr. Samuel Katz, Chairperson, opened the meeting at 8:00 a.m. on October 6. Dr. Walter Orenstein was Acting Executive Secretary.

Dr. Katz introduced Dr. David Scheifele, the new liaison representative for the Canadian National Advisory Committee on Immunization; Dr. Walter Hierholzer, standing in for Dr. David Fleming for the Hospital Infection Control Practices Advisory Committee (HICPAC); Dr. Rick Zimmerman, from the University of Pittsburgh, representing Dr. Ron VanBuren for the American Academy of Family Physicians; Dr. Anthony Robbins from the National Vaccine Program; and Dr. Gregory Poland, from the Mayo Clinic, filling in for American Hospital Association liaison member Dr. William Schaffner.

ACIP members and liaison representatives introduced themselves. Following this, the 45-plus members of the audience introduced themselves. It was an extensive group, including representatives of vaccine manufacturers, academia, state and federal government agencies, and churches.

Dr. Orenstein, head of the National Immunization Program, Executive Secretary Dr. Claire Broome had had a baby boy. There would be new seating arrangements at the next meeting. He asked for members and liaison representatives to announce conflicts of interest. Regardless of conflicts, all members participate in discussions; however, a person with a conflict cannot participate in a vote.

Dr. Katz reported his group is doing work with Lederle-Praxis recombinant vaccine; hepatitis A vaccines from Merck; and vaccines from Genentech, Microgenesys, and Biocine. Dr. M. Clements is also involved in HIV vaccine trials, involving vaccines produced by Chiron, Genentech, Virogenetics, Pasteur-Merieux United Biomedical Incorporation. She also serves as a consultant for Microgenesys and Virus Research Institute. Dr. Neal Halse is conducting vaccine studies involving vaccines from Connaught, Beecham, Merck, and Lederle-Praxis, and has received support conferences from SmithKline Beecham. Dr. Ted Mortimer is a consultant to Lederle-Praxis on acellular pertussis vaccine. Dr. Polack's research group receives some research support money from Connaught, Merck, and Johnson & Johnson Pharmaceuticals. Dr. Scheifele is a vaccine evaluation center that has projects funded by Connaught and SmithKline. Dr. Joel Ward currently has research support from Connaught, Merck Sharp & Dohme, and SmithKline Beecham. Dr. Kathy Edwards has received funding from vaccine studies from Connaught, Merieux, Lederle-Praxis, SmithKline Beecham, and is a consultant for Institute Merieux and for SmithKline Beecham.

Dr. Orenstein then explained the new Vaccines for Children Program. Under this program, the federal government will purchase vaccines for children who are on Medicaid or are Medicaid-eligible, those who have no insurance, and Native Americans. In addition, children who are served by federally qualified health centers can receive the vaccines if their private insurance does not cover immunizations. The importance of this program to the ACIP is that, under the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1993, the ACIP has the charge to determine the list of vaccines for routine administration to children under age 18 who receive vaccine through the Vaccines for Children Program, along with schedules regarding the appropriate periodicity, dosage, and contraindications applicable to the pediatric vaccines for this program. This program is to begin October 1, 1994.

Dr. Orenstein said the ACIP needed to vote on a proposed schedule for pediatric vaccines that the ACIP recommends. The process of public comment can begin. Final votes would be taken at the next meeting.

February ACIP meeting. Mr. Kevin Malone, from CDC's General Council, said this is the first time CDC has had to deal with an advisory committee becoming an operational one. He said he would prepare the draft of a motion on such a proposed list for members to vote on at this meeting.

### Varicella Statement

Dr. Sandra Holmes, NIP, then discussed the process by which the proposed ACIP varicella statement was produced. She then introduced the members of the Varicella Working Group (Drs. Edwards, Peter, Mortimer, Van Buren, De Buono, and Hall. Dr. Anne Gershon was consulted to the working group).

Dr. Holmes then summarized the 12 responses to the revised comprehensive draft circulated to the entire ACIP. The key issues were

- routine immunization with catch-up immunization was favored by 10 of 12 respondents.
- age for routine immunization preferred 12-18 months
- age for catch-up immunization preferred 2-12 years

Nine respondents were also in favor of immunizing health-care workers (HCWs). Six respondents favored immunizing family members of immunocompromised patients. Dr. Hardegree announced that the application for varicella vaccine has been submitted to the FDA and that active review is under way.

Then Dr. Holmes led the ACIP through specific wording about these key issues. After discussion of this vaccine's simultaneous administration with other vaccines (pp. 17-18 of the draft), Dr. Katz asked if committee members agreed that the general experience with living live and inactivated antigens together is that there has not been a vaccine, though more data and studies are needed. Members agreed with this statement were:

- drop the term "physician-documented" for documentation of chickenpox, substituting "a clear or reliable history"
- for recommendations for conditions requiring steroid therapy (asthma), reword to avoid negativity and to add a statement on consistency with other ACIP documents, which use 2 mg/kg/day as indicating immunosuppression.
- for recommendations for children on aspirin for rheumatoid arthritis, a small plurality voted to keep in the statement on p. 29 about adverse experiences but to drop the introductory use of "Although" and to soften the statement about avoiding salicylates for "6 weeks" to "4 weeks."

Regarding the adult and adolescent target groups (p. 20), was suggested that:

- a heading for HCWs be created; a table at the end of the document highlight HCWs; breakthrough infections need to be discussed for vaccinated HCWs who are exposed; varicella immunization be recommended for HCWs in contact with susceptible pregnant women; and that the latex agglutination test, which is a fast antibody test, be re-mentioned here.
- international travelers be dropped from the list of target groups.
- add that varicella immunization may be considered for normal adults without a history of chickenpox.
- indicate that nonpregnant women of childbearing age be "asked about their varicella history," not screened, as stated. Also, such women should be advised to avoid pregnancy for "3 months," not 3 months, as stated.
- correct the typographical error (<1%) about the incidence of febrile seizures after vaccination on page 23.

Regarding the statement's treatment of VZIG, the following suggested changes were made:

- In the discussion of pregnant women (pp. 34-35), balance the statement about risks of serious complications by indicating that there are data that show none.
- In the discussion of hospital personnel (pp. 35-36) indicate that we don't have the data for varicella but clarify the role and suggested timing of immune globulins.

Finally, Dr. Holmes asked that any further comments about the suggested tables or other matters be sent to her or Gloria Kovach in writing by October 27.

Before a break, Dr. Katz presented the ACIP with a farewell gift: an antique bell from New Hampshire, engraved with "May the ACIP recommendations always ring clearly." He gave it to Gloria to ring at the end of breaks.

### Reye Syndrome Update

Dr. Larry Schonberger, DVRD, NCID, asked Dr. Joseph Bresee to update the Committee on surveillance for Reye syndrome. Dr. Bresee said he had published surveillance information for 1991 indicated 15 cases nationwide. Dr. Schonberger said that occasional rare cases of the syndrome associated with bismuth subsalicylate or with long-term aspirin therapy of rheumatoid arthritis are reported to CDC, but he did not recall that any of the rheumatoid arthritis cases were associated with varicella.

## Review of Antiviral Recommendations for Influenza

Dr. Nancy Arden, VR, NCID, said that influenza activity has started early this season (e.g., three outbreaks since mid-August in Louisiana and numerous reports of flu-like illness in Ohio and other states) and that CDC has recommended that vaccination programs be completed by the end of October.

Rimantadine was approved for marketing on September 17. The new draft of "ACIP Recommendations for the Prevention and Control of Influenza, Part II. Antiviral Agents" contains more information on resistance, more specific and realistic information on prophylaxis, and more specific information on dosage and potential adverse reactions.

Dr. Nancy Cox, VR, NCID, then reviewed international surveillance for prevalence of amantadine- and rimantadine-resistant viruses and reviewed the mechanisms of antiviral activity of the two drugs. Less than 1% of influenza viruses isolated from individuals with no known exposure to amantadine or rimantadine are resistant to these drugs. Drug-resistant viruses have been isolated in certain clinical situations where rimantadine or amantadine have been used for treatment and prophylaxis. The likelihood that a new subtype or new variant of type A influenza virus with resistant M2 protein would emerge is not very great. Continued studies are needed to determine if the frequency of antiviral resistance of naturally occurring flu viruses increases with the increased use of antivirals.

It was suggested that the paragraph on pharmacology on p. 10 of the draft be dropped. In response to questions, Marjorie Nichols from Forrester Laboratories, the company that has brought rimantadine to the market, said that the cost of rimantadine will be \$29, vs. \$20 for amantadine. The generic costs are \$15 and \$10, respectively.

There was then considerable discussion about the negative wording regarding the use of rimantadine for children when it's clearly safer than amantadine. Donna Freeman from the FDA said that reviewers at FDA are aware that this is confusing and illogical. The pediatric indications are under active consideration with the manufacturer, but there are not enough data to support rimantadine for treatment of children. ACIP members wanted to soften the wording for use in children but were unsure if the ACIP should recommend something that the FDA doesn't. Finally, Dr. Arden asked for the appointment of a working group to resolve such issues. Its members are Dr. Clement and Dr. Hall and Dr. Donna Freeman from FDA.

## Update on the ACIP Recommendation for Meningococcal Vaccination

After noting that the ACIP statement on Hib was now being printed, Dr. Jay Wenger, DBMD, NCID, briefly reviewed changes in the final draft in Part I of the two-part meningococcal ACIP recommendation.



## Injury Compensation Update

Mr. Tom Balbier of the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program updated the committee on this program to resolve claims resulting from adverse reactions to covered vaccines. Several recent legislative amendments favorably affected this program. One result was that the spending authority for post-1988 award payments from the vaccine compensation trust fund was permanently extended; there is no chance that the excise tax will terminate again. There has also been an increase in the spending authority for the pre-1988 program, from \$80 million to \$110 million annually. He said that awards paid in 1993 totaled \$110.4 million. The accumulated, prospective excise tax collections exceed \$600 million.

## Vaccines For Children Program--Continued

Mr. Malone rejoined the group and distributed a proposed statement that the ACIP could send forward to the Secretary of HHS regarding current vaccines (see Handout #1). It was suggested that the following preparations be added to the list: Td, DT, monovalent measles, OPV and IPV, and combination products (DTP/hemophilus conjugate). It was asked if combination products needed to be listed separately. Mr. Malone said that he would think "any combination thereof" could be used instead, but that he would look into answering this. In discussion, it was decided not to add the varicella vaccine until licensure was approved.

Dr. Katz asked for a vote on the proposal, as written by Mr. Malone, with the caveat that the ACIP will go through the list of currently recommended vaccines very carefully, be considered acceptable to the Committee. The vote was unanimous in favor of the motion.

## Vaccine Liberalization of Measles Timing of First Dose to 12-15 Months

Next, Dr. Lauri Markowitz, NIP, discussed the liberalization of the measles schedule. She named the reasons for reconsidering the recommended age of vaccination to include children down to 12 months of age: 1) it would provide a chance to increase coverage and to eliminate missed opportunities; 2) there is now a large amount of data indicating earlier measles susceptibility of children born to vaccinated women; and 3) the two-dose measles schedule now used in the United States decreases the importance of small differences in response to vaccination at 12 and 15 months of age. She also reminded the group that vaccination at 12 months is already recommended in some populations.

She briefly reviewed five sources of data supporting the earlier susceptibility to measles of U.S. children: measles surveillance data; data indicating changing measles antibody titers in U.S. women; changing measles antibody titers in infants; increased risk of measles disease in infants born to younger women; and data on response to measles vaccine. Regarding the last point, Dr. Markowitz said that CDC's best estimate of

responses to measles vaccination at 12 months is 93%; it is 97%-99% among 15-month-olds. Almost all children who do not respond to the first dose of measles vaccine will respond to the second dose.

Dr. Markowitz said that the ACIP had three possible actions to consider: 1) leave the recommendations as they are now, pending further data on response to MMR vaccine at 12 and 15 months of age; 2) change the recommended age for MMR nationwide to 12 months; and 3) or alter recommendations to allow a more permissive 12- to 15-month MMR vaccination nationwide. When Dr. Katz asked for a vote, it was unanimous for the third recommendation. Dr. Katz then asked Dr. Markowitz to prepare a succinct summary of her presentation for the MMWR. A paragraph would be added that articulates the ACIP recommendation.

### Cost Benefit of Childhood Vaccinations

Dr. Steve Hadler, NIP, gave Dr. E. Hatziandreaou's summary of CDC/Batelle collaborative work to reexamine the benefits and costs of childhood immunizations. That study is updating earlier cost-benefit studies, filling in gaps from new studies, and using similar methodologies for all the vaccines. Complete or preliminary data are now available for DTP, MMR, and OPV. For DTP analyses, the bottom line is that for every \$1 spent, \$7 is saved in direct costs for health care. For MMR, the direct costs are \$15-\$20 saved for every dollar spent. For polio, almost \$4 is saved for every dollar spent. When indirect costs are also considered, cost benefit increases substantially for each vaccine.

Dr. Katz adjourned the meeting for the day at 5:30 p.m.

Dr. Katz opened the meeting on October 7 at 8:15.

### The President's New Immunization Initiative

Dr. D. A. Henderson, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Health Science, discussed the President's new immunization initiative, for which Dr. Henderson has responsibility. Although the United States has had an immunization program for 30 years, our immunization status is second only to Haiti in the Americas as the poorest immunization coverage for preschool children. He emphasized that the commitment of the President, the fact that he has made immunization a presidential initiative, is a huge boost--and probably half the battle, in turning such unsatisfactory rates around. He said that the initiative has a provision for developing registries for tracking immunization.

He then outlined the precise goals of the new initiative. The first and major one is to reduce vaccine-preventable disease occurrence. Thus, a major new emphasis will be placed on surveillance with careful investigation and confirmation of vaccine-preventable diseases. The target for most diseases is zero indigenous cases, except for pertussis, mumps, and hepatitis B.

The second set of goals relates to coverage. In the Year 2000 plans, 90% immunization coverage by age 2 years by the year 2000 is the goal. Dr. Donna Shalala, Secretary of Health and Human Services, has clearly indicated that this goal is unsatisfactory. Ninety percent coverage of 2-year-old children by 1996 would be satisfactory. By 90% coverage is meant 90% coverage by each of the individual antigens. This includes 3 doses each of DTP, OPV, and Hib vaccine and 1 dose of MMR vaccine.

Since there were no CDC data surveys of immunization coverage from 1985 to 1991, this will not be easy. In 1991, the National Center for Health Statistics undertook a Health Interview Survey, which found coverage rates of 82% for measles, 69% for DTP3, and 53% for OPV-3. There are not yet any data on Hib or hepatitis B. Nor are the data provided by state. Beginning in January 1994, the survey data will be confirmed by review of individual records. In addition, contracted random-digit-dialing surveys will provide state-by-state data by 1994. Finally, a stratified system for sampling in cities--using census and socioeconomic tract data and developed in the 1960s--will be rejuvenated to help metropolitan areas undertake their own immunization coverage surveys.

A third set of goals has to do with publicity and consciousness raising. In terms of specific activities, HHS plans to undertake an extensive publicity and consciousness-raising campaign. The Initiative has been inundated by various private sector and volunteer groups who are anxious to participate (e.g., McDonald's, Kiwanis, Rotary, Junior League, Walt Disney). He is working to present a comprehensive package of simple messages to raise the consciousness of parents about the importance of immunization.

Fourth, health-care providers, who tend to be complacent about immunization, also need to be involved. Right now, surveys show that only 70% of young children who go to HMOs--where immunizations are fully paid for--are fully immunized. Many physicians put it off, feeling the children will be immunized at school entry anyway.

Dr. Henderson cited the innovative methods to boost immunization employed by the United Kingdom, where immunization has never been mandatory. Immunization levels had hovered around 60%. When \$1000 bonuses were awarded to any physician who achieved a coverage rate of 70% for the children on his panel--and \$3000 if the rates rose to 90%--or the coverage rates rose within several years to 92%-96% rates for the different antigens. He said he was sure the United States could accomplish this high level of coverage.

NVP is also considering audits of HMOs, contacting insurance companies to get them to cover immunizations (for example, the insurance provider Merck wasn't covering immunization until recently). As a result, all insurance programs under the federal employee health benefit now offer immunization insurance; a year from now, it will be first dollar coverage.

Finally, Dr. Henderson pointed out that CDC's Division of Immunization is now the National Immunization Program, reporting directly to the CDC Director. He added that Dr. Kenneth Bart, who has been heading up the National Vaccine Program, is shifting to the Office of International Health in Washington, D.C., where his prime interests lie. Dr. Anthony Robbins is now head of the National Vaccine Program Office. Dr. Gina Rabinovich, Dr. Joel Breman, and Mr. Rick Leach (head of public relations for the Children's Immunization Initiative) are also joining the staff, now located at Room 730E, 20201 Hubert Humphrey Building.

Dr. Henderson summarized by saying he thought the country had an excellent chance of reaching 90% immunization coverage by 1996, establishing thereby a system to introduce other antigens in an appropriate manner. If we cannot reach that goal--providing the simplest, most cost-preventive measure in the health-care system to 90% of children--it raises the question of whether we could do any other preventive health care satisfactorily. In this sense, it is a litmus test of every health system.

#### Update on the National Vaccine Program

Dr. Anthony Robbins then discussed personnel changes in the National Vaccine Program. He announced a new subcommittee of the National Vaccine Advisory Committee, led by Dr. Barry Bloom, to determine future vaccine needs of the country and to enter into open dialogue with manufacturers. Dr. Robbins wants one or more members of the ACIP to participate on that subcommittee.

He then briefly discussed his program's work with CDC, HCA, and the National Governors Association in getting the Vaccines for Children program off the ground.

In follow-up discussion on Dr. Henderson's and Dr. Robbins' presentations, Dr. Henderson said that as far as prioritizing childhood immunization in the United States are concerned, two areas stand out: adult immunization and global initiatives, such as participation in the global effort to eradicate polio and the global Children's Vaccine Initiative. He also said he expected such activities to be added within 2 or 3 years. Dr. Henderson was also encouraged to stimulate insurance companies to cover adult immunizations and HMOs to increase coverage of adult immunizations as well. Dr. Robbins acknowledged that recordkeeping is a real problem but that the National Vaccine Program is encouraging the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation and others to provide grant support for innovative projects to develop registries and data systems to help with this. Dr. Orenstein said that hepatitis B would be incorporated into the Vaccines for Children Program and into the Childhood Immunization Initiative. However, the targeted coverage rate for 1996 would be 70% for this vaccine, not 90%.

better protection against mild disease with four doses; protection looks similar for more severe disease. An analysis using data from the supplementary pertussis surveillance system does suggest a later protective efficacy among children who received four doses. The absolute increase in efficacy was 5%, from 86% (3 doses) to 91% (4 doses).

Dr. Steve Rosenthal, NIP, discussed what adverse events are associated with the fourth dose of DTP and examined whether, if any, they differ in severity or frequency from those following other doses. Seizures-- primarily febrile seizures--following DTP4 vaccination were reported more frequently compared with doses 1-3. In the Vaccine Adverse Events Reporting System (VAERS), seizures following DTP administration at 15-24 months of age are reported more frequently compared with DTP given in the first year of life. Estimated coverage for DTP4 is 44% compared with 69% for DTP3, from the 1991 National Health Interview Survey. Therefore, rates of seizures temporally associated with DTP4 are likely to be higher. However, the peak incidence of febrile seizures in children corresponds with the recommended age of DTP4 administration. Reports of these and other adverse events temporally associated with vaccination at 15-24 months of age should decrease as the use of acellular pertussis vaccine increases. VAERS will monitor these trends.

Dr. Norman Begg, a consultant epidemiologist with the Public Health Laboratory Service in the United Kingdom, summarized the experience of that country with the pertussis schedule, which is three doses, given at 2, 3, and 4 months of age. He said that 93% of U.K. children are immunized with DTP. He said that their concern is that though three doses provide reasonable protection, they may not really be enough and that the country is "getting away with it" because of "natural boosting" from epidemics in the seventies and eighties. He said that if a fourth dose is now instituted, it will be with an acellular vaccine.

Dr. James Cherry from UCLA said the United States has the best immunization program in the world as far as pertussis is concerned. He presented data from two antibody studies showing that antibody levels drop off rather markedly after the third dose. Were the United States to give up the fourth dose of DTP, he said that pertussis will increase by 17% in 2- to 4-year-olds, and there will be 2,000 additional cases. Of these, 10% will have a sibling under 6 months of age who is not immune, perhaps leading to 160 cases in this age-group. Since 70% of cases in this age-group get admitted to the hospital, hospitalization costs alone would increase by \$1 million a year.

In terms of the epidemiology of pertussis in the United States, Dr. Cherry said that pertussis is very common in the population and we are all being exposed every day in the United States to it. IgA antibody studies indicate widespread infection. In short, he felt the United

### Summary of Agreed-Upon Actions

1. Dr. Jay Wenger said he would look into circulating Part II of the draft ACIP statement on meningococcal disease to the American College Health Association.
2. ACIP members and liaison representatives are to return comments on the draft ACIP varicella statement to Dr. Holmes or Ms. Kovach by October 27.
3. ACIP members and liaison representatives are to return comments on the meningococcal draft ACIP statement to Dr. Wenger or Ms. Kovach by Oct. 27.
4. Mr. Malone will look into whether each combination vaccine needs to be listed on the ACIP-provided schedule of vaccines or the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act).
5. Dr. Markowitz will prepare a succinct summary of her presentation on changing the recommended age for the first dose of MMR to 12-15 months so that it can be combined with a paragraph articulating ACIP's recommended change and published in the *MMWR*.
6. Ms. Kovach is to resolve the best date for the June 1994 meeting and notify members.