

# Working Lifetime Risk of Occupational Fatal Injury

---

David E. Fosbroke, MSF,\* Suzanne M. Kisner, BS, and John R. Myers, MSF

*Estimates of risk accumulated over a working lifetime are used to assess the significance of many workplace health hazards. Utilizing data from the National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) surveillance system, estimates of the risk of work-related fatal injuries are provided for the 50 industries and the 50 occupations having the highest risks. Cause-specific risk estimates are provided for the six occupations at the greatest risk of occupational fatal injuries. Results suggest that the risks of certain work-related fatal injuries in some occupations (e.g., loggers being struck by falling objects) are of the same magnitude as risks previously identified for specific occupational illness exposures (e.g., lung cancer among uranium miners exposed to ionizing radiation). Assuming a 45-year working lifetime, cause-specific fatal injury risks reported in this paper range from a predetermined minimum of 1 death per 1,000 lifetime workers to 36.4 deaths per 1,000 lifetime workers. These results suggest that risk assessment for traumatic causes of death should be considered equally with risk assessments for health exposures, such as potential carcinogens. Am. J. Ind. Med. 31: 459-467, 1997. © 1997 Wiley-Liss, Inc.†*

**KEY WORDS:** occupational fatal injury; lifetime risk; occupation; industry; cause-specific risk

## INTRODUCTION

The public-health literature contains many publications that attempt to define the relative risk of workers in different industries or occupations. These studies range from estimating the elevated numbers of deaths from certain illnesses or injuries for specific workers (e.g., proportionate mortality studies, standardized mortality studies) [Robinson et al., 1995; Singleton and Beaumont, 1989; Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 1987; Mace, 1986; Milham, 1983] to estimating a worker's lifetime risk of dying of a stated illness based on exposure to a hazard in a specific job [Palmer and Rickett, 1992; Nurminen et al., 1992; Stayner et al., 1992; Smith and Stayner, 1990; Hodgson and Jones, 1990; Friedberg et al., 1989; Dong et al., 1988; NIOSH, 1987; Purchase et al., 1987; Siegel et al., 1983].

Lifetime risk assessments are useful studies of risk because of their utility for setting priorities on hazardous exposures for developing interventions. The concept of lifetime risk also has a second critical value associated with regulatory use as a basis for defining whether a particular hazard is significant [Stayner, 1992]. Currently, the Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) considers a lifetime risk of 1 death in 1,000 workers to be a significant level of risk to justify standards development, especially for cancer-causing agents [Stayner, 1992; Adkins, 1993].

This concept of lifetime risk has not been widely applied to occupational injury deaths. The reasons for this include the lack of sufficient detail in data records to define the workers' detailed occupation and the cause of the workers' death, as well as a tendency to focus on annual fatality rates for defining a workers' risk of fatal injury. Publications have defined annualized fatal injury rates by detailed occupation [Leigh, 1987, 1988; Meng, 1991] while other research has defined industry and occupation risk in less detail or for a small number of selected occupations [Jenkins et al., 1993; Toscano and Windau, 1995a,b]. Leigh [1995] reported detailed industry and occupation rates for injuries and illnesses combined and provides the number of deaths by cause associated with each fatality rate. However,

---

National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health, Division of Safety Research, Morgantown, West Virginia.

\*Correspondence to: David E. Fosbroke, National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health, Division of Safety Research, 1095 Willowdale Road, Morgantown, West Virginia 26505.

Accepted for publication 30 July 1996. †This article is a US Government work and as such, is in the public domain in the United States of America.

these papers have not attempted to define the concept of lifetime risk for detailed industries and occupations, or provided cause-specific lifetime risk estimates based on annualized fatality rates.

The purpose of this work was to examine the use of lifetime risk based on national fatality data from the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) surveillance system. The main research objectives of the study were to define the general lifetime risk of occupational injury death within detailed industries and occupations, and to define cause-related lifetime risks for those occupations identified as having the highest general lifetime risks. While annual rates and lifetime risk estimates produce equivalent assessment of risk, this paper uses a lifetime risk model for injury that can be compared with risk assessments for occupational illnesses.

**METHODS**

The data source used to define occupational fatalities was the NIOSH NTOF for the calendar years 1990 and 1991. The NTOF data were collected as a census of death certificates from all 52 Vital Statistics reporting agencies in the U.S. Inclusion criteria for the NTOF were: (1) death resulting from an external cause of injury (E-codes 800–999) according to the International Classification of Diseases, Ninth Revision (ICD-9) [World Health Organization, 1977], (2) victim’s age at least 16, and (3) a positive response to the death certificate’s ‘Injury at Work?’ item.

Numerous publications have described the NTOF system, its methods, and its limitations. The most recent description summarizes data for the decade of the 1980s [Jenkins et al., 1993]. Since NTOF is death-certificate based, interpretation of results presented in this paper should consider the limitations of death certificates for ascertaining work-related fatal injuries, including errors of omission and misclassification [Bell et al., 1990], recording of usual industry and occupation [Steenland and Beaumont, 1984], and underreporting of occupational motor vehicle-related deaths [Russell and Conroy, 1991].

In spite of the limitations, Stout and Bell [1991] report an average capture rate of 81% for death certificates used in ten studies of work-related fatal injury. The NTOF surveillance system used in this study provides the most detailed data on occupational fatal injuries during the study period of 1990 through 1991.

The 1990 and 1991 NTOF data were manually coded for detailed industry and occupation codes using the Bureau of the Census (BOC) 1980 classification system [1982]. Data prior to 1990, which had been coded using a 1987 computer algorithm accurate only at the industry and occupation division level [Castillo and Jenkins, 1994], were not used in this study. Denominator data were obtained from

**TABLE I.** Bureau of the Census Occupation Codes That Have Been Combined to Match Employment Information from the Bureau of Labor Statistics and Were Among the Fifty Most Injury Hazardous Occupations

| Combined code | Occupation                            | 1980 Bureau of Census codes                      |
|---------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| S450          | Other Building Services Occupations   | 454, 455   |
| S473          | Farmers                               | 473, 474   |
| S475          | Farm Managers                         | 475, 476   |
| S488          | Other Agriculture-Related Occupations | 488, 489   |
| S490          | Other Forestry & Logging Occupations  | 494, 495   |
| S497          | Fishing Hunting Trapping Occupations  | 497, 498, 499                                    |
| S504          | Other Vehicle Mechanics               | 506, 515, 517                                    |
| S558          | Construction Supervisors              | 553, 554, 555, 556, 557, 558                     |
| S599          | Other Construction Trades Occupations | 569, 576, 583, 584, 587, 589, 594, 596, 598, 599 |
| S617          | Extractive Occupations                | 613, 614, 615, 616, 617                          |
| S655          | Other Precision Metal Workers         | 635, 636, 639, 643, 644, 645, 646, 649, 654, 655 |
| S699          | Other Plant & System Operators        | 695, 699   |
| S826          | Rail Transport Occupations            | 823, 824, 825, 826                               |
| S830          | Water Transport Occupations           | 828, 829, 833, 834                               |
| S859          | Other Material Moving Occupations     | 843, 845, 848, 859                               |
| S868          | Other Helpers                         | 866, 867   |

the 1990 and 1991 annual employment averages published by the BLS in Employment and Earnings, which are based on the Current Population Survey [BLS 1991, 1992]. For some occupations, detailed employment data were not published in Employment and Earnings. These occupations were combined with other occupations using the 1980 BOC hierarchy of codes, which allowed employment estimates to be calculated. A list of combined occupation codes are presented in Table I. Annualized rates were calculated on a per 1,000 full-time worker basis to facilitate comparison with reported rates for illnesses.

The lifetime risk for a specific industry or occupation was calculated using an equation proposed by the Occupational Safety and Health Administration [1995]:  $WLTR = [1 - [1 - R]^y] \times 1000$  where: WLTR = working lifetime risk; R = probability of a worker having a work-related fatal injury in a given year;  $1 - R$  = probability of a worker not having a work-related fatal injury in a given year;  $y$  = years of exposure to work-related injury;  $(1 - R)^y$  = probability of

surviving 'y' years without a work-related fatal injury;  $1 - (1 - R)^y$  = probability of having a work-related fatal injury over 'y' years of employment.

In this study, y was set at 45 years. This assumes that workers are exposed to work-related injury hazards for approximately 45 years, starting at age 20. This time period is consistent with work-life values used in many quantitative risk assessments for occupational illnesses [Stayner, 1992]. The lifetime risk formula estimates the average lifetime risk for workers in a given occupation or industry. The formula does not predict an individual's probability of fatal injury given his/her occupation.

The lifetime risk formula also assumes that exposure to fatal occupational injury is constant over a 45-year period. Though an individual's risk may vary over any given 45-year period and the risk of fatal injury varies by demographic characteristics (e.g., age), the average annual fatality rate for an occupation is determined by the risk of all individuals comprising the occupation at a point in time. The above formula assumes that this average risk remains constant for a working lifetime, which is necessary to project a lifetime risk estimate comparable to risk estimates for occupational illness.

The ICD-9 E-codes for the six occupations with the highest general lifetime risk were examined to determine cause-specific lifetime risks that were greater or equal to 1 death per 1,000 workers.

## RESULTS

Table II presents the 1990–1991 fatality counts, annualized fatality rates, and general lifetime risk values for the 50 highest-risk industries in the United States. Data for other industries are available from the authors. The industry with the highest lifetime risk was Logging (BOC Industry code 230), followed by Commercial Fishing, Hunting, and Trapping (code 031), Taxicab Service (code 402), Coal Mining (code 041), and Water Transportation (code 420). The highest number of fatalities were reported in Construction (code 060), followed by Trucking Service (code 410), Agricultural Crop Production (code 010), Logging (code 230), and Justice, Public Order, and Safety (code 910).

Table III presents the general lifetime risks for the 50 most hazardous occupations. Data for additional occupations are available from the authors. The six highest risk occupations were Timber Cutting and Logging Occupations (BOC Occupation code 496), Fishers, Hunters, and Trappers (codes 497, 498, and 499), Water Transportation Occupations (codes 828, 829, 833, and 834), Structural Metal Workers (code 597), Extractive Occupations (codes 613, 614, 615, 616, and 617), and Airplane Pilots (code 226). The occupation with the most fatalities was Heavy Truck Drivers (code 804), followed by Farmers (codes 473 and 474), Construction Laborers (code 869), Timber Cutting and

Logging Occupations (code 496), Construction Supervisors (codes 553, 554, 555, 556, 557, and 558), and Farm Workers (codes 477, 483, and 484).

The causes of death that were associated with lifetime risks greater or equal to 1 death per 1,000 lifetime workers are presented in Table IV. These values are only for the six highest risk occupations identified in Table III.

Among these six occupations, the highest cause-specific lifetime risk occurred among workers in Timber Cutting and Logging Occupations being struck by falling objects (36.4 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers), followed by Airplane Pilots killed in other and unspecified accidents to an aircraft (e.g., non-landing or take-off plane crash, explosion on plane, collision with birds) (21.1 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers). Cause-specific lifetime risks greater than 10 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers were also identified for Fishers, Hunters, and Trappers. These were drownings associated with water transportation (14.1 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers) and watercraft accidents causing submersion (11.9 deaths per 1,000 workers).

## DISCUSSION

### High-Risk Industries and Occupations

The identification of high-risk industries and occupations, presented on Tables II and III, respectively, agree closely with other studies that have reported annualized fatality rates by industry or occupation in the U.S. [Leigh, 1987, 1988, 1995; Toscano and Windau, 1995a,b]. Variance between the results of these earlier studies and the NTOF-based rates presented here is due mostly to differences in the data sources used to identify occupational fatalities and the time periods covered by these studies. The studies by Leigh [1987, 1988, 1995] were based on workers' compensation records, which miss industries, such as commercial fishing and agricultural production (both crop and livestock), that states generally do not require to have workers' compensation insurance [Chamber of Commerce, 1991]. Occupations that were highly associated with these industries missed by workers' compensation (e.g., fishers, farmers) were underreported or excluded from Leigh's analyses—a limitation acknowledged by Leigh in his works. Leigh [1995] includes fatalities resulting from both injuries and illnesses in calculation of work-related fatality rates; therefore, Leigh identifies some occupations (e.g., stone cutters and carvers) with high rates due to illness, but few or no fatal injuries.

The annualized rates reported by Toscano and Windau [1995a,b] were based on the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Census of Fatal Occupational Injuries (CFOI) surveillance system. The CFOI has an advantage over the NTOF surveillance system in that the CFOI uses multiple

**TABLE II.** The Fifty Highest Fatal Injury Risk<sup>a</sup> Industries in the United States for 1990 and 1991 Based on the 1980 Bureau of the Census Industry Coding System. Lifetime Risk Assumed a 45-Year Work Life

| BOC code | Industry                               | 1990–1991 deaths | 1990–1991 annual rate <sup>b</sup> | Lifetime risk <sup>b</sup> |
|----------|--|------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 230      | Logging                                | 318              | 1.07071                            | 47.0641                    |
| 031      | Fish/Hunt/Trapping                     | 148              | 0.92500                            | 40.7891                    |
| 402      | Taxicab Service                        | 109              | 0.48230                            | 21.4748                    |
| 041      | Coal Mining                            | 129              | 0.42857                            | 19.1050                    |
| 420      | Water Transportation                   | 135              | 0.36585                            | 16.3316                    |
| 010      | Agricultural Production: Crops         | 635              | 0.31878                            | 14.2447                    |
| 040      | Metal Mining                           | 33               | 0.25000                            | 11.1883                    |
| 042      | Oil/Gas Extraction                     | 195              | 0.24164                            | 10.8160                    |
| 410      | Trucking Service                       | 760              | 0.20197                            | 9.0482                     |
| 050      | Nonmetal Mine/Quarries                 | 36               | 0.16071                            | 7.2066                     |
| 531      | Scrap/Waste Materials                  | 52               | 0.15710                            | 7.0451                     |
| 030      | Forestry                               | 23               | 0.13772                            | 6.1789                     |
| 060      | Construction                           | 1952             | 0.13204                            | 5.9247                     |
| 231      | Sawmills/Planing Mills/Millwork        | 101              | 0.12965                            | 5.8178                     |
| 400      | Railroads                              | 76               | 0.12709                            | 5.7031                     |
| 551      | Farm Products-Raw Materials            | 24               | 0.12632                            | 5.6684                     |
| 741      | Detective/Protective Services          | 97               | 0.12565                            | 5.6385                     |
| 200      | Petroleum Refining                     | 36               | 0.11726                            | 5.2633                     |
| 471      | Sanitary Services                      | 67               | 0.11693                            | 5.2483                     |
| 270      | Blast Furnaces/Steel Works             | 85               | 0.11214                            | 5.0337                     |
| 552      | Petroleum Products                     | 35               | 0.11182                            | 5.0196                     |
| 751      | Auto Repair                            | 224              | 0.10964                            | 4.9220                     |
| 421      | Air Transportation                     | 156              | 0.10841                            | 4.8668                     |
| 672      | Fuel Dealers                           | 25               | 0.10776                            | 4.8377                     |
| 021      | Landscape/Horticulture Services        | 140              | 0.10550                            | 4.7365                     |
| 191      | Agricultural Chemicals                 | 9                | 0.09677                            | 4.3456                     |
| 360      | Ship/Boat Building                     | 48               | 0.09091                            | 4.0827                     |
| 561      | Farm Supplies                          | 23               | 0.08846                            | 3.9730                     |
| 020      | Agricultural Services, NEC             | 53               | 0.08576                            | 3.8520                     |
| 011      | Agricultural Production: Livestock     | 211              | 0.08567                            | 3.8478                     |
| 621      | Gas Service Stations                   | 82               | 0.08515                            | 3.8246                     |
| 650      | Liquor Stores                          | 22               | 0.07885                            | 3.5422                     |
| 110      | Grain Mill Products                    | 22               | 0.07639                            | 3.4317                     |
| 251      | Cement/Concrete/Gypsum                 | 30               | 0.07614                            | 3.4207                     |
| 851      | Vocational Schools                     | 10               | 0.07092                            | 3.1865                     |
| 450      | Electric Light/Power                   | 99               | 0.06962                            | 3.1281                     |
| 760      | Misc. Repair Services                  | 70               | 0.06869                            | 3.0866                     |
| 401      | Bus Service/Urban Transit              | 62               | 0.06561                            | 2.9481                     |
| 272      | Primary Aluminum                       | 17               | 0.06320                            | 2.8399                     |
| 532      | Misc. Wholesale, Durables              | 18               | 0.06186                            | 2.7797                     |
| 101      | Dairy Products                         | 19               | 0.05901                            | 2.6518                     |
| 660      | Jewelry Stores                         | 22               | 0.05851                            | 2.6296                     |
| 910      | Justice/Public Order/Safety            | 238              | 0.05843                            | 2.6261                     |
| 440      | Radio/TV Broadcasting                  | 30               | 0.05803                            | 2.6079                     |
| 901      | General Government, NEC                | 69               | 0.05623                            | 2.5274                     |
| 470      | Water Supply/Irrigation                | 24               | 0.05581                            | 2.5085                     |
| 411      | Warehousing/Storage                    | 15               | 0.05376                            | 2.4165                     |
| 611      | Food Stores, NEC                       | 21               | 0.05371                            | 2.4140                     |
| 192      | Industrial/Misc. Chemicals             | 63               | 0.05259                            | 2.3637                     |
| 891      | Noncommercial Educ/Scientific Research | 16               | 0.05195                            | 2.3349                     |

<sup>a</sup>Deaths are from the National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) Surveillance System and employment is from the Bureau of Labor Statistics

<sup>b</sup>“Employment and Earnings” annual averages.

<sup>c</sup>Rates in units per 1,000 full-time workers.

**TABLE III.** The Fifty Highest Fatal Injury Risk<sup>a</sup> Occupations in the United States for 1990 and 1991 Based on the 1980 Bureau of the Census Occupation Coding System. Lifetime Risk Assumed a 45-Year Work Life

| BOC <sup>b</sup> code | Occupation                            | 1990–1991 deaths | 1990–1991 annual rate <sup>c</sup> | Lifetime risk <sup>c</sup> |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 496                   | Timber Cutting/Logging                | 256              | 1.43820                            | 62.7129                    |
| S497                  | Fishing Hunting Trapping Occupation   | 131              | 1.07377                            | 47.1956                    |
| S830                  | Water Transport Occupations           | 103              | 0.91150                            | 40.2058                    |
| 597                   | Structural Metal Workers              | 77               | 0.66957                            | 29.6908                    |
| S617                  | Extractive Occupations                | 193              | 0.65646                            | 29.1182                    |
| 226                   | Airplane Pilots                       | 135              | 0.62791                            | 27.8690                    |
| 844                   | Operating Engineers                   | 174              | 0.40000                            | 17.8425                    |
| 577                   | Electrical Power Installers/Repairers | 86               | 0.36596                            | 16.3362                    |
| 809                   | Taxicab Drivers/Chauffers             | 136              | 0.33831                            | 15.1111                    |
| 869                   | Construction Laborers                 | 485              | 0.32904                            | 14.7000                    |
| 804                   | Truck Drivers (Heavy)                 | 1097             | 0.28560                            | 12.7717                    |
| S473                  | Farmers                               | 602              | 0.27326                            | 12.2232                    |
| S859                  | Other Material Moving Occupations     | 63               | 0.27273                            | 12.1994                    |
| S490                  | Other Forestry & Logging Occupations  | 17               | 0.26984                            | 12.0710                    |
| 423                   | Sheriffs, Bailiffs                    | 49               | 0.21304                            | 9.5422                     |
| 595                   | Roofers                               | 85               | 0.20936                            | 9.3779                     |
| 544                   | Millwrights                           | 35               | 0.20349                            | 9.1161                     |
| S826                  | Rail Transport Occupations            | 44               | 0.18803                            | 8.4266                     |
| 199                   | Athletes                              | 27               | 0.17881                            | 8.0148                     |
| S558                  | Construction Supervisors              | 208              | 0.16417                            | 7.3609                     |
| 519                   | Machinery Maintenance Occupations     | 8                | 0.16327                            | 7.3206                     |
| 516                   | Heavy Equipment Mechanics             | 50               | 0.15674                            | 7.0290                     |
| S599                  | Other Construction Trade Occupations  | 123              | 0.14784                            | 6.6311                     |
| S504                  | Other Vehicle Mechanics               | 16               | 0.14414                            | 6.4660                     |
| 885                   | Garage, Service Station Occupations   | 60               | 0.14052                            | 6.3037                     |
| 727                   | Sawing Machine Operators              | 27               | 0.13706                            | 6.1490                     |
| 575                   | Electricians                          | 186              | 0.13527                            | 6.0692                     |
| 418                   | Police and Detectives (Public)        | 128              | 0.13361                            | 5.9949                     |
| 783                   | Welders and Cutters                   | 143              | 0.12522                            | 5.6194                     |
| S699                  | Other Plant and System Operators      | 22               | 0.12155                            | 5.4550                     |
| S479                  | Farm Workers                          | 206              | 0.11880                            | 5.3321                     |
| 849                   | Crane and Tower Operators             | 20               | 0.11561                            | 5.1891                     |
| 563                   | Brickmasons/Stonemasons               | 39               | 0.10864                            | 4.8769                     |
| 588                   | Concrete Terrazzo Finishers           | 15               | 0.10791                            | 4.8446                     |
| 653                   | Sheet-Metal Workers                   | 26               | 0.10700                            | 4.8035                     |
| 757                   | Separating Machine Operators          | 13               | 0.10656                            | 4.7839                     |
| S868                  | Other Helpers                         | 2                | 0.10000                            | 4.4901                     |
| 853                   | Excavating Machine Operators          | 20               | 0.09852                            | 4.4239                     |
| 426                   | Guards and Police (Private)           | 131              | 0.09675                            | 4.3445                     |
| 696                   | Stationary Engineers                  | 21               | 0.09459                            | 4.2479                     |
| 417                   | Firefighters                          | 38               | 0.09383                            | 4.2135                     |
| S655                  | Other Precision Metal Workers         | 26               | 0.08935                            | 4.0127                     |
| 657                   | Cabinet Makers                        | 9                | 0.08182                            | 3.6752                     |
| S488                  | Other Agriculture-Related Occupations | 3                | 0.08108                            | 3.6421                     |
| S475                  | Farm Managers                         | 23               | 0.08070                            | 3.6251                     |
| 527                   | Telephone Line Installers/Repairers   | 10               | 0.07937                            | 3.5652                     |
| 505                   | Automobile Mechanics                  | 136              | 0.07879                            | 3.5396                     |
| 585                   | Plumbers/Pipefitters/Steamfitters     | 70               | 0.07821                            | 3.5135                     |
| 218                   | Surveying/Mapping Technicians         | 11               | 0.07746                            | 3.4800                     |
| S450                  | Other Building Service Occupations    | 8                | 0.07692                            | 3.4557                     |

<sup>a</sup>Deaths are from the National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) Surveillance System and employment is from the Bureau of Labor Statistics

<sup>b</sup>“Employment and Earnings” annual averages.

<sup>c</sup>Occupation codes preceded by the letter “S” are combinations of similar BOC occupation codes (see Table I).

<sup>d</sup>Rates are in units per 1,000 full-time workers.

**TABLE IV.** Causes of Death, by the Six Highest Fatal Injury Risk<sup>a</sup> Occupations, That Have a Lifetime Risk of 1 Death per 1,000 Workers or Greater, Based on Data for 1990 and 1991. Lifetime Risk Assumed a 45 Year-Work Life

| Occupation   | Cause of death                     | ICD-9 | Lifetime risk <sup>b</sup> |
|--|------------------------------------|-------|----------------------------|
| Timber Cutting/Logging Occupations (BOC 496)               | Struck by Falling Object           | E916  | 36.4                       |
|  | Machinery                          | E919  | 6.4                        |
|  | Struck by or Against Object        | E917  | 3.4                        |
|  | Electric Current                   | E925  | 1.5                        |
|  | Assault by Firearms                | E965  | 1.5                        |
|  | Cutting/Piercing Equipment         | E920  | 1.2                        |
| Fishing, Hunting, Trapping Occupations (BOC 497, 498, 499) | Drowning in Water                  |       |                            |
|  | Transport                          | E832  | 14.1                       |
|  | Accident to Watercraft             |       |                            |
|  | Causing Submersion                 | E830  | 11.9                       |
|  | Drowning, Submersion               | E910  | 5.8                        |
|  | Other Accident to Aircraft         | E841  | 1.4                        |
|  | Water Transport Unspecified        |       |                            |
|  | Fall                               | E835  | 1.0                        |
|  | Water Transport Machinery          | E836  | 1.0                        |
|  | Machinery                          | E919  | 1.0                        |
| Water Transport Occupations (BOC 828, 829, 833, 834)       | Drowning in Water                  |       |                            |
|  | Transport                          | E832  | 7.0                        |
|  | Drowning, Submersion               | E910  | 4.7                        |
|  | Accident to Watercraft             |       |                            |
|  | Causing Submersion                 | E830  | 3.9                        |
|  | Water Transport Fall, 1            |       |                            |
|  | Level to Other                     | E834  | 2.7                        |
|  | Fire on Watercraft                 | E837  | 2.7                        |
|  | Machinery                          | E919  | 2.3                        |
|  | Struck by Object                   | E917  | 1.6                        |
| Structural Metal Workers (BOC 597)                         | Accident to Watercraft             | E831  | 1.2                        |
|  | Causing Other Injuries             |       |                            |
|  | Fall from Building                 | E882  | 8.0                        |
|  | Fall from 1 Level to Other         | E884  | 4.6                        |
|  | Fall from Ladder, Scaffold         | E881  | 3.4                        |
|  | Struck by Falling Object           | E916  | 3.0                        |
| Extractive Occupations (BOC 613, 614, 615, 616, 617)       | Electric Current                   | E925  | 2.3                        |
|  | Machinery                          | E919  | 1.9                        |
|  | Struck by Falling Object           | E916  | 7.8                        |
|  | Machinery                          | E919  | 6.3                        |
|  | Explosive Material                 | E923  | 2.4                        |
| Airplane Pilot (BOC 226)                                   | Electric Current                   | E925  | 1.7                        |
|  | Other Accident to Aircraft         | E841  | 21.1                       |
|  | Accident During Takeoff or Landing | E840  | 3.3                        |

<sup>a</sup>Deaths are from the National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) Surveillance System and employment is from the Bureau of Labor Statistics "Employment and Earnings" annual averages.

<sup>b</sup>Rates in units per 1,000 full-time workers.

record sources to identify work-related deaths, which improves the capture rate of the CFOI. Still, the results from the CFOI data for 1993 and 1994 tend to identify the same high-risk occupations as identified on Table III.

The main difference between the NTOF and the CFOI occupation-specific results was the identification of commercial fishermen as being the highest-risk occupation by the CFOI rather than timber cutting and logging occupations. Employment data were not available for just fishermen in the 1990 and 1991 *Employment and Earnings* [Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1991, 1992], thus fishermen were combined with commercial hunters and trappers in this NTOF study. The 1993 CFOI annualized fatality rate for fishers, hunters, and trappers was also higher than the rate for logging, which could be due to the better capture rate of fatality cases in the CFOI over the NTOF surveillance system.

Comparisons between the NTOF and the CFOI for high-risk industries were not possible because the CFOI results reported by Toscano and Windau [1995a,b] did not provide detailed industry rates. The 1993 CFOI results also contain a miscalculated rate for agricultural services. The 1993 agricultural services employment estimate should have been 1,079,000 workers [Bureau of Labor Statistics, 1995], rather than the reported 165,000 workers. Using the correct employment estimate lowers the agricultural services fatality rate from 94 deaths per 100,000 workers to 14 deaths per 100,000.

Even with the differences in data sources, time periods covered, and employment numbers used by Leigh, Toscano and Windau, and this study, the list of occupations at highest risk for fatal work injuries are very similar. Timber cutting and logging occupations, airplane pilots, structural metal workers, taxicab drivers, and electrical linemen are consistently identified to be occupations with high fatality rates. Toscano and Windau and this study also identified fishing, hunting, and trapping occupations, and farm operators, as having high fatality rates.

### Cause-Specific Lifetime Risks

The cause-specific lifetime risks for the six most hazardous occupations (Table IV) indicate that there are causes of injury death that represent significant risks for specific occupations. Several of these high-risk causes of death for specific occupations have been reported in previous research: the risks associated with logging by Myers and Fosbroke [1994]; risks of fishing by Bender [1994]; and falls for structural metal workers by Suruda et al., [1995]. Being struck by falling objects has also been reported as a major cause of death for underground miners [Mine Safety and Health Administration, 1990], a major occupational segment of the Extractive Occupations group. The concept of lifetime risk, however, was not addressed in any of these works.

**TABLE V.** Lifetime Risk Estimates from Published Studies Identifying Occupational Exposures to Hazardous Substances

| Authors                 | Population                  | Exposure  | Working lifetime | Illness       | Lifetime risk (deaths/1,000 workers) <sup>a</sup> |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------|---|------------------|---------------|---|
| Nurminen et al., 1992   | General exposed population  | 0.2 mg silica/m <sup>3</sup> <sup>b</sup>                   | 40 Years         | Silicosis     | 8.7   |
| Palmer and Rickett 1992 | Surgeons                    | 18,000 operations w/pop.<br>HIV rate = 0.0036% <sup>b</sup> | 35 Years         | HIV Infection | 0.67  |
| Stayner et al., 1992    | Cadium Smelters             | 100 µg/m <sup>3</sup> Cadium Fumes <sup>c</sup>             | 45 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 50–100  |
| Thun et al., 1991       | Cadium Smelters             | 200 µg/m <sup>3</sup> -years Cadium Fumes <sup>b</sup>      | 45 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 60  |
| Smith and Stayner 1990  | Miners                      | 1.5 mg/m <sup>3</sup> Diesel Part. <sup>d</sup>             | 47 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 15–30   |
| Hodgson and Jones, 1990 | Tin Miners                  | 4 WLM/Year Radon <sup>c</sup>                               | 40 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 79  |
| Friedberg, et al., 1989 | Air Carrier Crewmembers     | 0.2–9.1 mSv/year Galactic Cosmic Radiation <sup>e</sup>     | 20 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 0.1–5.0   |
| Dong et al., 1988       | Steelworkers                | >2.50 mg/m <sup>3</sup> Coke Oven Emmissions <sup>d</sup>   | 40 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 40  |
| NIOSH 1987              | Uranium Miners              | 4 WLM/Year Radon <sup>c</sup>                               | 30 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 35–40   |
|                         |                             | 1 WLM/Year Radon  | 30 Years         | Lung Cancer   | 5–10  |
| Siegel, et al., 1983    | Workers exposed to OSHA PEL | 3 ppm Formaldehyde <sup>c</sup>                             | Unknown          | Cancer        | 6.2   |

<sup>a</sup>Lifetime risk is expressed as deaths/1,000 workers.

<sup>b</sup>Medium exposure level.

<sup>c</sup>Regulatory standard exposure level.

<sup>d</sup>High exposure level.

<sup>e</sup>High risk coefficient.

The fatal injury risks presented in Table IV are comparable with lifetime risk estimates from studies for occupational exposures that result in such health outcomes as cancer or HIV infection shown in Table V. The lifetime risk of 36 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers for timber cutting and logging occupations due to being struck by falling objects is approximately the same risk identified for lung cancer among uranium miners exposed to ionizing radiation [NIOSH, 1987], and among workers exposed to cadmium fumes [Stayner et al., 1992; Thun et al., 1991]. The risk of airplane pilots dying from aviation accidents other than landings or take-offs (21.1 deaths/1,000 lifetime workers) is also similar to the lung cancer risk of uranium miners.

The remaining lifetime risks presented in Table IV, ranging from 1 to 14 deaths per 1,000 lifetime workers, are all comparable to lifetime risk estimates for cancer-causing occupational exposures such as formaldehyde [Siegel et al., 1983], diesel exhausts [Smith and Stayner, 1990], silica [Nurminen et al., 1992], galactic radiation [Friedberg et al., 1989], and coke oven emissions [Dong et al., 1988]. This suggests that specific injury events are as great a fatal hazard to certain occupations as cancer-causing exposures are for others.

The lifetime risks presented here are simplistic, using industry and occupation as surrogates for exposure, rather than accounting for exact exposure times to injury-causing

events. Unlike occupational illness risk assessment studies, where exposures are well defined but outcomes are unclear, the relationship of the death to the work-related activity is clear but the worker's exposure is undefined. Injuries are acute events associated with the transfer of hazardous levels of energy. A fatality only occurs when the energy source contacts the worker in a specific way (e.g., a tree falling on a logger's leg may cause a severe fracture, but probably not death, while the same tree striking the logger's head will usually cause death). Since the worker is only exposed to a potential fatal injury hazard for a portion of the workday, the estimation of exposure for traumatic injuries is complex and require data that do not currently exist at the national level.

Better risk assessment of fatal injuries will require the development of new hazard-surveillance models that take into account a worker's exposure to fatal levels of energy [Griefe et al., 1995]. If such systems are developed, then risk assessment may be extended to the actual evaluation of job-specific tasks, and to the development of appropriate injury-prevention strategies.

## CONCLUSIONS

Previous studies have identified worker populations having elevated annual fatal-injury rates. Generally, these

studies have been limited to identifying relatively heterogeneous groups (e.g., construction workers, precision production, craft and repair workers) that account for a large proportion of fatalities, or that have a high annual fatality rate. Even in studies which have reported annual fatality rates of detailed industries and occupations, rates have not been provided to allow comparison of risk among different occupations by cause of death. Using Bureau of Census industry and occupation categories as a surrogate for exposure, this study identifies more specific worker populations at risk of fatal occupational injury. In order to facilitate comparison of cause-specific injuries with occupational disease risks, fatal-injury rates are presented in terms of working lifetime risk.

The use of lifetime risk to define traumatic injury hazards is a concept that has not been widely examined by safety professionals or injury-control researchers. The results of this paper suggest that when lifetime risk is considered for traumatic injuries, the risks for specific causes of death for certain occupations are of the same magnitude as impermissible cancer risks identified for specific occupational exposures. Therefore, risk assessment for traumatic causes of death should be considered equally with risk assessments for illness-causing exposures.

If prevention activities (e.g., training, regulation, administrative and engineering controls) are to focus on the most important fatal-injury problems, more emphasis must be placed on conducting hazard surveillance and developing exposure surveillance systems for traumatic-injury events. Such information will allow for the development of more complex lifetime risk models for traumatic injuries and better risk assessment of the hazards associated with occupation-specific work tasks.

## REFERENCES

- Adkins CE (1993): Occupational Safety and Health. In Burke TA, Tran NL, Roemer JS, and Henry CJ (eds): "Regulating Risk: The Science and Politics of Risk." Washington, DC: ISIC Press, pp 23–24.
- Bell CA, Stout NA, Bender TR, Conroy CS, Crouse WE, and Myers JR (1990): Fatal occupational injuries in the United States, 1980 through 1995. *JAMA* 263:3047–3050.
- Bender TR (1994): Commercial fishing fatalities: U.S. regional comparisons. In Myers ML and Klatt ML (eds): "Proceedings of the National Fishing Industry Safety & Health Workshop (DHHS [NIOSH] Pub No 94-109)." Cincinnati, OH: National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health, pp 39–44.
- Bureau of the Census (1982): "Alphabetical Index of Industries and Occupations" Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.
- Bureau of Labor Statistics (1991, 1992, 1995): "Household Data Annual Averages. Employment and Earnings 38,39,42 (No. 1 of each)." Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.
- Castillo DN, Jenkins EL (1994): Industries and occupations at high risk for work-related homicides. *J Occup Med* 36:125–132.
- Chamber of Commerce (1991): "Analysis of Workers' Compensation—1991 Edition." Washington, DC: Chamber of Commerce.
- Commonwealth of Pennsylvania (1987): "Mortality Experience of Pennsylvania Workers: 1983–1985." Harrisburg, PA: Pennsylvania Department of Health.
- Dong MH, Redmond CK, Mazumdar S, Costantini JP (1988): A multistage approach to cohort analysis of lifetime lung cancer risk among steelworkers exposed to coke oven emissions. *Am J Epidemiol* 128:860–873.
- Friedberg W, Faulkner DN, Snyder L, Darden EB Jr, O'Brien K (1989): Galactic cosmic radiation exposure and associated health risks for air carrier crewmembers. *Aviation, Space, Environ Med* 60:1104–1108.
- Griefe A, Halperin W, Groce D, O'Brien D, Pedersen D, Myers J, Jenkins L (1995): Hazard surveillance: Its role in primary prevention of occupational disease and injury. *Appl Occup Environ Hyg* 10:737–742.
- Hodgson JT, Jones RD (1990): Mortality of a cohort of tin miners 1941–86. *Br J Ind Med* 47:665–676.
- Jenkins EL, Kisner SM, Fosbroke DE, Layne LA, Stout NA, Castillo DN, Cutlip PM, Cianfrocco R (1993): "Fatal Injuries to Workers in the United States, 1980–1989: A Decade of Surveillance—National Profile (DHHS [NIOSH] Pub No 93-108)." Morgantown, WV: National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health.
- Leigh JP (1987): Estimates of the probability of job-related death in 347 occupations. *J Occup Med* 29:510–519.
- Leigh JP (1988): Odds ratios of work related deaths in United States workers. *Br J Ind Med* 45:158–166.
- Leigh JP (1995): "Causes of Death in the Workplace." Quorum Books, Westport, CT.
- Mace L (1986): Leading causes of death by industry group: South Carolina, 1983–1985. Columbia, SC: South Carolina Department of Health.
- Meng R (1991): How dangerous is work in Canada? Estimates of job-related fatalities in 482 occupations. *J Occup Med* 33:1084–1090.
- Milham S Jr (1983): "Occupational Mortality in Washington State, 1950–1979 (DHHS [NIOSH] Pub No 83-116)." Cincinnati, OH: National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health.
- Mine Safety and Health Administration (1990): Mine Injuries and Worktime, Quarterly (Closeout Edition 1989). Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.
- Myers JR, Fosbroke DE (1995): Logging fatalities in the United States by region, cause of death, and other factors—1980 through 1988. *J Safety Res* 25:97–105.
- National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (1987): "Testimony of the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health on the Mine Safety and Health Administration Proposed Rule: Ionizing Radiation Standards for Metal and Nonmetal Mines." Cincinnati, OH: National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health.
- Nurminen M, Corvalan C, Leigh J, Baker G (1992): Prediction of silicosis and lung cancer in the Australian labor force exposed to silica. *Scand J Work Environ Health* 18:393–399.
- Occupational Safety and Health Administration (1995): "Estimation of Lifetime Risks for Injury-Related Deaths (internal data analysis)." Washington, DC: Occupational Safety and Health Administration.
- Palmer JD, Rickett JWS (1992): The mechanisms and risks of surgical glove perforation. *J Hosp Infection* 22:279–286.
- Purchase IFH, Stafford J, Paddle GM (1987): Vinyl chloride: An assessment of the risk of occupational exposure. *Food Chem Toxicol* 25:187–202.
- Robinson C, Stern F, Halperin W, Veneble H, Petersen M, Frazier T, Burnett C, Lalich N, Salg J, Sestito J, Fingerhut M (1995): Assessment of mortality in the construction industry of the United States, 1984–1986. *Am J Ind Med* 28:49–70.

- Russell J, Conroy C (1991): Representativeness of deaths identified through the injury-at-work item on the death certificate: Implications for surveillance. *Am J Public Health* 81:1613–1618.
- Siegel DM, Frankos VH, Schneiderman MA (1983): Formaldehyde risk assessment for occupationally exposed workers. *Regulatory Toxicol Pharmacol* 3:355–371.
- Singleton JA, Beaumont JJ (1989): “California Occupational Mortality, 1979–1981, Adjusted for Smoking, Alcohol, and Socioeconomic Status.” Sacramento CA: California Department of Health Services.
- Smith MA, Stayner L (1990): “An Exploratory Assessment of the Risk of Lung Cancer Associated with Exposure to Diesel Exhaust Based on a Study in Rats (NTIS Pub No PB91-116269).” Cincinnati, OH: National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health.
- Stayner L (1992): Methodologic issues in using epidemiologic studies for quantitative risk assessment. In Clewell HJ III (ed): “Conference on Chemical Risk Assessment in the Department of Defense (DoD): Science, Policy, and Practice.” Cincinnati, OH: American Conference of Governmental Industrial Hygienists, Inc, pp 43–51.
- Stayner L, Smith R, Thun M, Schnorr T, Lemen R (1992): A dose-response analysis and quantitative assessment of lung cancer risk and occupational cadmium exposure. *Ann Epidemiol* 2:177–193.
- Steenland K, Beaumont J (1984): The accuracy of occupation and industry data on death certificates. *J Occup Med* 26:288–296.
- Stout NA, Bell C (1991): Effectiveness of source documents for identifying fatal occupational injuries: A synthesis of studies. *Am J Public Health* 81:725–728.
- Suruda A, Fosbroke D, Braddee R (1995): Fatal work-related falls from roofs. *J Safety Res* 26:1–8.
- Thun MJ, Elinder CG, Friberg L (1991): Scientific basis for an occupational standard for cadmium. *Am J Ind Med* 20:629–642.
- Toscano G, Windau J (1995a): National census of fatal occupational injuries, 1994. *Compensation and Working Conditions*, Sept.
- Toscano G, Windau J (1995b): The changing character of fatal work injuries. In: “Fatal Workplace Injuries in 1993: A Collection of Data and Analysis (Report 891).” Washington, DC: Bureau of Labor Statistics, pp 6–17.
- World Health Organization (1977): “International Classification of Diseases: Manual on the International Statistical Classification of Diseases, Injuries, and Causes of Death, Ninth Revision.” Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization.