

1                   **Detection of Airborne Lactococcal Bacteriophages in Cheese Plants**

2

3     Daniel Verreault<sup>a,b</sup>, Louis Gendron<sup>a,b</sup>, Geneviève M. Rousseau<sup>c</sup>, Marc Veillette<sup>a</sup>, Daniel Massé<sup>d</sup>,  
4                   William G. Lindsley<sup>e</sup>, Sylvain Moineau<sup>b,c</sup>, and Caroline Duchaine<sup>a,b,\*</sup>

5

6     <sup>a</sup>Centre de Recherche, Institut Universitaire de Cardiologie et de Pneumologie de Québec, 2725  
7                   Chemin Ste-Foy, Québec City, Québec, Canada, G1V 4G5

8     <sup>b</sup>Département de biochimie, de microbiologie et de bio-informatique, Faculté des sciences et de  
9                   génie, Université Laval, Québec City, Québec, Canada, G1V 0A6

10     <sup>c</sup>Groupe de recherche en écologie buccale (GREB) and Félix d'Hérelle Reference Center for  
11     Bacterial Viruses, Faculté de médecine dentaire, Université Laval, Québec City, Québec, Canada,  
12                   G1V 0A6

13     <sup>d</sup>Dairy and Swine Research and Development Centre, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 2000  
14                   College Street, Sherbrooke, Québec, Canada J1M 0C8

15     <sup>e</sup>Health Effects Laboratory Division, National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health,  
16                   Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Morgantown, West Virginia, USA 26505

17

18     \*Corresponding author. Centre de Recherche, Hôpital Laval, Institut Universitaire de Cardiologie  
19     et de Pneumologie, 2725 Chemin Ste-Foy, Québec City, Québec, Canada, G1V 4G5, Phone: +1  
20     418 656 8711 ext.5837 Fax: +1 418 656 4509; e-mail: [caroline.duchaine@bcm.ulaval.ca](mailto:caroline.duchaine@bcm.ulaval.ca)

21

**Abstract**

22

23       The dairy industry adds starter bacterial cultures to heat-treated milk to control the  
24 fermentation process during the manufacture of many cheeses. These highly concentrated  
25 bacterial populations are susceptible to virulent phages that are ubiquitous in cheese factories. In  
26 this study, the dissemination of these phages by the airborne route and their presence on working  
27 surfaces were investigated in a cheese factory. Several surfaces were swabbed and five air  
28 samplers (polytetrafluoroethylene filter, polycarbonate filter, BioSampler, Coriolis cyclone  
29 sampler and NIOSH two-stage cyclone bioaerosol personal sampler) were tested. Samples were  
30 then analyzed for the presence of two *Lactococcus lactis* phage groups (936 and c2) and  
31 quantification was done by qPCR. Both lactococcal phage groups were found on most swabbed  
32 surfaces while airborne phages were detected at concentrations of at least  $10^3$  genomes/m<sup>3</sup> of air.  
33 The NIOSH sampler had the highest rate of air samples with detectable levels of lactococcal  
34 phages. This study demonstrates that virulent phages can circulate through the air and that they  
35 are ubiquitous in cheese manufacturing facilities.

36

## Introduction

37

38 A variety of food products, commodity chemicals, and biotechnology products are  
39 manufactured through large-scale bacterial fermentations (13). Because significant amounts of  
40 bacterial cells are cultivated in fermentation vats, most of these industries have experienced  
41 problems with phage contamination. Phage outbreaks represent an industrial concern because  
42 they can slow down the fermentation process and adversely impact product quality, resulting in  
43 extra costs and delays (13). The dairy industry has been working to control phage populations for  
44 decades (28). Cheesemakers can experience "slow vats" to various levels depending on, among  
45 others, the type of fermented milk product, the starter culture system, and the factory design.  
46 According to estimations, 0.1 to 10% of all milk fermentations are negatively affected by virulent  
47 phages (27).

48 The dairy industry relies on selected bacterial cultures for the production of an array of  
49 fermented milk products. For example, several strains of the low-GC Gram-positive bacterium  
50 *Lactococcus lactis* are extensively used for the transformation of milk into cheeses. The  
51 lactococcal starter culture population can reach levels of up to  $10^9$  cfu/ml of milk inside large  
52 industrial fermentation vats (24). This ecosystem is also ideal for the multiplication of virulent *L.*  
53 *lactis* phages, which are ubiquitous in dairy environments (3). If phage-sensitive host cells are  
54 dominant in the starter culture, a virulent phage inside one of these vats can initiate an infection  
55 and its progeny will eventually lyse numerous starter cells and slow down the fermentation  
56 process leading to low-quality fermented products (28). Significant progress has been made in the  
57 control of phage populations within this food sector as several strategies are now available to  
58 keep these bacterial viruses at bay (for review see 13). For example, a typical cheese plant uses

59 several *L. lactis* strains on a rotation schedule to prevent the build-up of specific phages.  
60 Nonetheless, phage infection remains a considerable risk in cheesemaking because phage  
61 populations have evolved over time and they can be disseminated through various routes. The  
62 source(s) of the phages and their dissemination routes must be identified in order to implement  
63 corrective actions to limit their propagation (13).

64 Virulent phages can originate from a variety of sources. New virulent phages can be  
65 introduced into a cheese plant through raw milk, which can be contaminated at low concentration  
66 (23). Moreover, some lactococcal phages can withstand pasteurization (1, 21). Novel virulent  
67 phages can also emerge within a factory through mutations and recombination events when wild-  
68 type phages infect sensitive hosts (18, 35). Reservoirs of phages include the materials and  
69 equipments used in the manufacturing process, as well as the fermentation products and by-  
70 products (13). Milk with little or no contamination can also be put at risk by the addition of  
71 phage-contaminated ingredients such as whey protein concentrates (13, 15). Although rarely  
72 documented, phage contamination can also occur through aerosolization. Concentrations of up to  
73  $10^8$  pfu/m<sup>3</sup> of air have been detected in some areas, mainly downstream of the fermentation  
74 process in a German cheese plant (30-32).

75 Phage aerosolization can occur during air displacements or movements around  
76 contaminated surfaces or fluids. It can also occur by liquid splashes, which can aerosolize phages  
77 (40). Aerosol contamination represents a major microbiological challenge, especially when the  
78 aerosol sources and contents are not known. Studies of the airborne distribution of phages could  
79 help identify sources and determine the impact of aerosols on failed milk fermentations.

80 Viruses can be found on aerosol particles of various sizes from the sub-micrometer range  
81 to tens of micrometers in aerodynamic diameter. Several types of samplers are available for

82 characterization the viral load in the air (for review see 40). However, no standard procedure  
83 exists at present for the sampling of airborne viruses. The efficacy of these samplers is often  
84 assessed on the basis of the recovery of infectious viral particles. Many of them have destructive  
85 effects on the virus structure, leading to false negative results in viral culture assays (40, 41).  
86 Plaque assays are cumbersome because they require the use of several bacterial hosts as the  
87 phage host range differs from one isolate to another (12, 25). Plaque assays may not always be  
88 feasible because pure culture may not be available if commercial defined-strain or mixed-strain  
89 bacterial cultures are used to make the fermented milk products. Consequently, it has been argued  
90 that analytical methods that are independent of viral infectivity, such as the detection of phage  
91 genomes by quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR), are more suitable for the analysis of  
92 dairy samples (3, 9, 10, 12, 17, 33, 42) as well as air samples (41).

93         The aim of this study was to compare the efficiency of five aerosol samplers in recovering  
94 airborne lactococcal bacteriophages in a cheese plant and to assess subsequent detection of the  
95 phages by qPCR. The presence of these phages on various working surfaces was also  
96 investigated. Although *L. lactis* phages are currently classified into ten genetically-distinct groups  
97 (11), only the two most common groups, namely the 936 and the c2, were targeted in this study.  
98 Members of these phage groups have been isolated worldwide and belong to the *Siphoviridae*  
99 family with a double-stranded DNA genome and a long, non-contractile tail (7, 8, 14, 16, 20-22,  
100 25, 26, 34-36, 38, 39).

## Materials and Methods

101

102

103 **Sampling site.** A factory producing cheddar cheese was chosen for aerosol sampling. This cheese  
104 factory uses commercial mesophilic starter cultures containing *L. lactis* strains, which are rotated  
105 on a daily basis. A typical aerosol sampling session started at the beginning of cheese production  
106 in the morning and lasted for approximately 12 hours. Multiple fermentation vats were filled with  
107 pasteurized milk daily. The aerosol sampling was performed in the filling section at the end of the  
108 production line near a cheese whey source. Since the air from the initial sections of the cheese  
109 production line was moved towards this section, it was likely to contain the largest quantity of  
110 airborne lactococcal phages. Due to space restrictions within the factory, the sampling site was  
111 conducted in two zones separated by approximately 5 meters.

112

113 **Air Sampling.** Air sampling in the cheese factory was done using five types of samplers  
114 (Table 1): 0.4  $\mu\text{m}$  polycarbonate (PC) filters (SKC Inc., Eighty Four, PA), 0.3  $\mu\text{m}$   
115 polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) membrane filters (SKC Inc.), BioSamplers (SKC Inc.), a Coriolis  
116 cyclone sampler (Bertin Technologies, Montigny-le-Bretonneux, France) and NIOSH two-stage  
117 bioaerosol cyclone (BC 251) personal samplers (4).

118 PC and PTFE filters were mounted on cellulose pads and housed in 37-mm clear styrene  
119 three-piece cassettes (SureSeal, SKC Inc.), and were plugged into pumps (GilAir-5, Gilian,  
120 Sensidyne, LP, Clearwater, FL) calibrated at a flow rate of 2 L/min. Six filters of each type were  
121 evenly distributed in the two sampling areas and used for a period of 710 min. Thus, a total of  
122 1420 liters of air was sampled per filter. The closed-faced filters were positioned with the inlets  
123 facing the ground.

124 BioSamplers were placed in Styrofoam boxes to prevent any broken glass from being  
125 scattered in the factory in the event of equipment breakage. The boxes were positioned on tables  
126 and the samplers were plugged into pumps (Vac-U-Go Sampling Pump, SKC Inc.). Fifteen ml of  
127 sterile water with 0.01% Tween® 20 was used as a sampling liquid in the BioSamplers. Twenty-  
128 minute samples were taken with the critical orifices providing a sampling rate of 12.5 L/min.  
129 Thus, a total of 250 liters of air was recovered per BioSampler sample.

130 Ten ml of sterile water with 0.01% Tween® 20 was used in the sampling cones of the  
131 Coriolis which was run for a period of 10 minutes at 300 L/min. The evaporated liquid was  
132 replaced to provide a final volume of 10 ml after the first sample was taken. The same sampling  
133 cone was used three times and the remaining liquid volume was measured after the last sample  
134 was taken. Therefore, this sampler concentrated 9000 L of air in each sample in 30 min. The  
135 procedure was repeated with five sampling cones at one sampling site.

136 Four NIOSH samplers were distributed on two sites to provide 350 min sampling periods  
137 at 10 L/min using calibrated AirCon-2 pumps (Gilian). Each NIOSH sampler was assembled  
138 using a 15 ml (stage 1) plastic tube, a 1.5 ml (stage 2) plastic tube and a 0.4- $\mu$ m PC capillary pore  
139 filter (SKC Inc.). Thus, a total of 3500 liters of air was sampled per assay. The Coriolis sampler  
140 and the Airborne Particle Counter (APC, Met One model 3313-3-1, Pacific Scientific  
141 Instruments, Grants Pass, OR) were placed 1.3 meters and 2 meters above ground level  
142 respectively due to space restrictions. All the other samplers were placed approximately 1 meter  
143 above ground level. The APC sampled the air at 28.3 L/min, and airborne particles were analyzed  
144 in channels of 0.3, 0.5, 1.0, 5.0, and 10.0  $\mu$ m.

145 The limit of detection for each sampler (Table 3) was determined by taking into  
146 consideration the volume of air sampled, the dilution factor of the liquid suspension, and the limit  
147 of detection of the qPCR reaction.

148

149 **Surface sampling.** Several surfaces in the cheese factory were swabbed with polyester fiber  
150 tipped plastic applicators (Fisher Scientific Company, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada). The tips were  
151 first wet in sterile water with 0.01% Tween® 20, cut after swabbing, and kept in 1 ml of the same  
152 liquid. Whenever possible, the areas swabbed were approximately 100 cm<sup>2</sup>. However, the exact  
153 size of the areas swabbed is not known in some cases owing to the limited or uneven surfaces.  
154 Therefore, these results are considered qualitative.

155

156 **Sample treatment and analysis.** All samples were kept on ice after on site sampling and then  
157 stored at 4°C until analyses, which were performed within 48 hours. PTFE and PC filters were  
158 eluted by placing 5 ml of sterile water with 0.01% Tween® 20 directly into the three-piece  
159 cassettes and by shaking the filters on a vortexer for 20 min. The volume of liquid in the  
160 BioSamplers and the Coriolis samplers was measured and the liquid was stored at 4°C. For the  
161 NIOSH samplers, 250 µl of sterile water with 0.01% Tween® 20 was placed in each tube. The  
162 1.5 ml tubes were pulse-shaken on a vortexer until the pellet was no longer visible. The 15-ml  
163 tubes were processed in the same way; however, the tubes were also shaken upside-down to clean  
164 the upper part of the tube. No DNA extraction was necessary for qPCR analysis. Every sample  
165 was analyzed by qPCR in triplicate as a minimum.

166 **Quantitative polymerase chain reaction primer and standard curve design.** Primers for  
167 quantitative polymerase chain reactions (qPCR) were designed using the Beacon Designer 4.0  
168 program (PREMIER Biosoft International, Palo Alto, CA) for SYBR Green protocols. The  
169 primer pair used for the detection of the lactococcal 936 phage group has already been published  
170 (41). The targeted region was within the *orf6* of phage P008, a gene coding for a highly  
171 conserved structural protein within the 936 group (22, 35). Reverse and forward primers were  
172 5'-CCAGCAGTAGGGCGAACAAAG-3' (positions 5187 to 5167) and  
173 (5'-TGAGGGAGACGGAACAAACGG-3' (positions 5035 to 5055), respectively. For the c2  
174 group, we targeted the gene coding for the highly conserved major capsid protein (20). Reverse  
175 and forward primers were 5'-GCATTAAAGCCAACTGATAGC-3' (positions 9642 to 9662) and  
176 5'-AGTAAGAGGGATAGCGAAC-3' (positions 9432 to 9451) respectively.

177 The qPCR experiments were performed on a DNA Engine Opticon 2 apparatus (Bio-Rad  
178 Laboratories, Hercules, CA) in 96-well plates. The qPCR reaction mixture consisted of 0.5  $\mu$ M  
179 forward primer, 0.5  $\mu$ M reverse primer and a 1X final concentration of iQ SYBR Green  
180 Supermix (Bio-Rad Laboratories) in a final volume of 25  $\mu$ l, 5  $\mu$ l of which was the template  
181 DNA or sample. The standard curve was built using  $10^0$  to  $5 \times 10^6$  plasmid copies (see below) per  
182 reaction tube and was repeated in duplicate on each plate. The results from three plates were  
183 pooled to determine the equations of the slope used to calculate phage concentration. The  
184 protocol used for qPCR was 94°C for 3 min (hot start) followed by 35 cycles of 1) 94°C for 20 s;  
185 2) 60°C or 53°C for 30 s for 936 and c2, respectively; 3) plate reading; and 4) 72°C for 25 s. A  
186 melting curve was calculated with readings every 0.2°C from 50°C to 95°C holding the  
187 temperature for 1 s. The cycle threshold or C(t) was set at a fluorescence intensity of 0.011 for all  
188 plates.

189 For both phage groups, plasmids containing the amplicon obtained with the primers were  
190 used as template for the construction of standard curves. Plasmids were obtained using the TOPO  
191 cloning reaction (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA) and purified using the QIAprep Spin Miniprep Kit  
192 (Qiagen Inc., Mississauga, ON, Canada). The optical density of the purified plasmid at 260 nm  
193 was used to determine its concentration and aliquots of known concentrations were prepared.

194 For all aerosol samplers, viral extraction efficiency for DNA quantification was verified  
195 by inoculating the samplers with a known concentration of 936-like phages. The phage  
196 suspension was inoculated into the liquid sampling media for the Coriolis and BioSampler and  
197 was extracted after sampling HEPA filtered air. The phage suspension was allowed to dry in the  
198 NIOSH and filters prior to air sampling. Viral extractions were done as described for the  
199 environmental samples.

200

201 **Specificity of the primers.** The primer pairs were tested on 23 different lactococcal phages of  
202 the 936 group and 7 different phages of the c2 group (Table 2) as well as one phage of the P335  
203 group used as a negative control. All these phages had previously been isolated from cheese  
204 factories and kept at the Felix d'Hérelle Reference Center for Bacterial Viruses  
205 ([www.phage.ulaval.ca](http://www.phage.ulaval.ca)). Lysates were diluted in sterile water and used directly as a template for  
206 qPCR. Both primer pairs were used on all lysates to verify the specificity of the primers towards  
207 different isolates of the same phage groups. Results were confirmed both by the melting curves  
208 and by migration on 2% agarose gels for 30 min at 100 V. Furthermore, the PCR-amplicons  
209 obtained from 28 randomly selected positive air and surface samples were sequenced to ensure  
210 primer specificity.

211

212 **Statistical analysis.** For the air samples, data were expressed as median and interquartile range.  
213 Statistical analyses were performed using the mean values. One-way ANOVA was used to  
214 analyze experimental factors associated with the comparison of samplers. For qPCR results,  
215 values were log transformed to stabilize the variances. Reported P values are based on these  
216 transformations. The univariate normality assumptions were verified with the Shapiro-Wilk tests.  
217 Brown and Forsythe's variation of Levene's test was used to verify the homogeneity of variances.  
218 The Tukey multiple comparison technique was applied *posthoc* to the ANOVA. The results were  
219 considered significant with P values  $\leq 0.05$ . All analyses were conducted using the SAS  
220 statistical package, version 9.2 (SAS Institute Inc.).

## 221 **Results**

222

223 **Testing of primer pairs for specificity in qPCR assays.** To confirm that the selected primers  
224 were able to detect a diverse set of phages belonging to either the 936-like or the c2-like phages,  
225 we tested them in qPCR assays using the phages listed in Table 2. Both pairs of 21-nucleotide  
226 primers were specific to either the 936- or the c2-like phages (Table 2). No false negative or false  
227 positive results were obtained with the primers. According to the standard curves obtained, the  
228 limit of detection varied from 1 to 50 genome copies per reaction tube for the 936 qPCR protocol  
229 and from 5 to 50 genome copies per reaction tube for the c2 qPCR protocol. Moreover, all the  
230 sequenced qPCR amplicons were in accordance with the anticipated phage groups as identified  
231 by the qPCR protocol.

232

233 **Size distribution of airborne particles.** The size distribution of airborne particles in the cheese  
234 factory was monitored throughout the sampling period by collecting data with the APC for 5 min  
235 at a time followed by 15 min waiting times. Mean counts of particles per cubic meter of air for  
236 each of the six channels of the APC are shown in Figure 1. Airborne particle concentration and  
237 size distribution was stable throughout the study.

238

239 **Comparison of air samplers for the recovery of lactococcal phages.** Samples from samplers  
240 spiked with known concentrations of 936-like phages were analyzed by qPCR. Concentrations  
241 detected were within the same order of magnitude as the theoretical concentrations (data not  
242 shown). Viral extractions from the samplers were satisfactory for proper comparison of sampler

243 efficiencies. Results obtained from the qPCR analysis of the aerosol samples are summarized in  
244 Table 3. Interestingly, lactococcal phages belonging to both groups were detected with all air  
245 samplers, indicating that a significant number of phages were suspended in the air within the  
246 cheese plant. However, the sampler efficiency varied considerably.

247         The first stage of the NIOSH sampler was more efficient at detecting both 936-like- and  
248 c2-like phages (Table 3). When the results for the detection of both phage groups are combined,  
249 22 out of 24 samples (92%) were positive in the first stage and 16 out of 24 (67%) were positive  
250 in the second stage. The differences in the concentration of airborne phages found in the first and  
251 second stages of the NIOSH sampler were very significant, with 16-fold more phages being  
252 detected in the first stage than in the second stage ( $p<0.0001$ ) for 936-like phages. No difference  
253 was observed for c2-like phages. It should be noted that the NIOSH sampler had the lowest limit  
254 of detection.

255         A total of 75 out of 104 (72%) samples from the Coriolis were positive for lactococcal  
256 phages when the results of the two phage groups are combined (Table 3). The concentrations of  
257 airborne c2-like phages detected were significantly higher with the Coriolis sampler than with the  
258 stages 1 (23-fold,  $p<0.0001$ ) and 2 (17-fold,  $p=0.002$ ) of the NIOSH sampler. By contrast,  
259 detection of 936-like phages was significantly lower than with stage 1 (5-fold,  $p<0.0001$ ) and  
260 significantly higher than with stage 2 (3-fold,  $p=0.002$ ) of the NIOSH.

261         The PC and PTFE filters showed equivalent phage recovery giving almost the same  
262 number of positive samples. No significant difference was found between the two filter types in  
263 the concentration of airborne viruses recovered. However, statistical analyses based on mean  
264 values showed that PC filters allowed the detection of 3-fold more airborne 936 phages than the

265 Coriolis. Overall, the two filters were still less efficient than the NIOSH and Coriolis samplers  
266 (Table 3). They were particularly deficient in the recovery of c2-like phages.

267 The BioSampler showed a very high detection limit in terms of viral genomes per m<sup>3</sup> of  
268 air (Table 3). Every phage genome detected in qPCR analysis of the BioSampler samples  
269 represented 10<sup>4</sup> phages genomes/m<sup>3</sup> of air. Only 1 sample out of 18 allowed the detection of  
270 airborne 936-like phages, whereas 3 out of 18 qPCR reactions revealed c2-like phages. However,  
271 for positive samples, the BioSampler detected the highest concentrations of airborne viruses. This  
272 sampler allowed the detection of more than 100 fold higher concentrations of airborne viruses  
273 than stages 1 and 2 of the NIOSH and more than 10 fold higher concentrations than the two  
274 filters and the Coriolis sampler.

275

276 **Surfaces.** Various surfaces were swabbed in the factory to check for the presence of c2-like and  
277 936-like phages. Using the swabbing method, the limit of detection for the 936-like phages was  
278 1.4 phage genomes per cm<sup>2</sup> and was five-fold higher for the c2 group. Both phage groups were  
279 found on most of the surfaces swabbed (100 cm<sup>2</sup>) as evidenced by qPCR assays (Table 4).  
280 Concentrations of 936-like phages ranged from 3 genome copies/cm<sup>2</sup> on the top of a closed  
281 fermentation tank to 9.1x10<sup>3</sup> genome copies/cm<sup>2</sup> on the handle of a door leading to the office area  
282 of the cheese plant, whereas c2 concentrations reached 3.1x10<sup>3</sup> genome copies/cm<sup>2</sup> on the surface  
283 of cleaning material.

284

**Discussion**

285

286 The source(s) of phages as well as their dissemination routes should be identified in a  
287 cheese plant in order to implement long-term corrective actions to limit phage propagation and  
288 improve overall product quality (13). Contamination sources and dissemination routes are not  
289 easy to identify as several control points need to be checked. Because virulent dairy phages have  
290 a narrow host range (12, 25), it is not practicable to use culture assays to detect them in various  
291 dairy environments including air samples. Additionally, phages can deteriorate and lose their  
292 infectivity during sampling and sample processing (40). Molecular biology methods independent  
293 of phage infectivity and of bacterial hosts can facilitate the analysis of the viral content of  
294 environmental samples (40). In this study, quantitative PCR using SYBR Green fluorescence and  
295 primers specific to conserved regions was successfully performed to detect the two main  
296 lactococcal phage groups in various samples from a cheese plant, including air samples.

297

298 Only a few studies to date have shown that airborne phages can be detected in industrial  
299 cheese plant settings (30-32). We also had some anecdotal evidences that ventilation breakdowns  
300 lead to increased phage contamination. Our analyses of air samples confirmed that lactococcal  
301 phages can be disseminated through the airborne route since up to  $2.7 \times 10^4$  and  
302  $6.6 \times 10^4$  lactococcal phage genomes were detected per  $\text{m}^3$  of air using the BioSampler (Table 3).  
303 Considering that it takes only a few infectious phages to infect phage-sensitive *L. lactis* cells and  
304 start the phage lytic cycle, cheese factories should possess adequate ventilation and control the  
airflow to minimize phage dissemination as much as possible.

305 Our study also clearly demonstrates that phage genomes can be found on various surfaces  
306 including floors, walls, cleaning materials, pipes, door handles, and office tables. While it is not  
307 known if these viral nucleic acids are still part of infectious phages, it is safe to assume that they  
308 were at some point. These findings underscore the need to train workers regarding the importance  
309 of surfaces as sources of phage contaminations. They also suggest that the use of appropriate  
310 cleaning procedures and effective sanitizers needs to be carefully evaluated to reduce the risks of  
311 phage problems.

312 Although we successfully detected phages in aerosols using different air samplers, not all  
313 samplers showed the same level of efficiency. The air sampling devices used in earlier studies on  
314 airborne phages in cheese plants (30, 32), were based on a gelatin membrane filtration and on  
315 impaction on agar. Although the devices were able to detect phages, they have practical  
316 drawbacks. For example, gelatin membrane filtration can dry and break during prolonged  
317 sampling or it can dissolve if liquid droplets are sampled. By contrast, impaction on agar relies on  
318 plaque assays, which is difficult to apply when a variety of bacterial strains are employed daily.  
319 Besides the concern about drying during prolonged sampling with this latter system, only large  
320 aerosol particles can be sampled. In fact, there is no standard and approved protocol to detect  
321 viral aerosols, let alone phages.

322 The NIOSH sampler gave the most reliable results in this study. It had the highest  
323 proportion of positive samples, low between-samples variability, and the lowest detection limit.  
324 The two stages of the NIOSH sampler were analyzed separately to take advantage of the  
325 aerodynamic size separation that took place with this sampler. At a sampling rate of 10 L/min,  
326 the 50% cut-off is 2.1  $\mu\text{m}$  for the first stage and 0.41  $\mu\text{m}$  for the second stage while the remainder  
327 of the aerosol is captured by the third stage. The second stage of this sampler detected the lowest

328 airborne concentrations of 936-like phages while the first stage detected the highest  
329 concentration. This suggests that most airborne 936-like phages were bound to larger particles.  
330 However for the c2-like phages, there was no difference in the concentrations detected in the two  
331 stages of the sampler, indicating that these phages were present at similar concentrations on the  
332 smaller and the larger particles. It is not clear at present why this difference was observed. Both  
333 phage groups belong to the *Siphoviridae* family but have somewhat different morphology.  
334 Phages belonging to the 936 group have an isometric capsid approximately 60 nm in diameter  
335 and a long non-contractile tail ranging from 140 nm to 200 nm (morphotype B1) whereas c2-like  
336 phages have a prolate capsid (60 nm x 40 nm) and a 100-nm-long non-contractile tail  
337 (morphotype B2) (26).

338         Of all the samplers tested, the BioSampler allowed the highest recovery of airborne phage  
339 concentrations. However, given its very high detection limit and the few positive samples  
340 collected, this sampler was less suitable for the determination of the airborne phage  
341 concentrations.

342         The Coriolis sampler has the advantage of collecting a large volume of air in a very short  
343 time period. However, with its very high flow rate (300 L/min), this sampler can draw in particles  
344 with greater inertia (greater aerodynamic size) than can the filters (2 L/min), the NIOSH  
345 (10 L/min) or the BioSampler (12.5 L/min). Considering that the mass of a particle is  
346 proportional to the cubic value of the radius, a few large particles can drastically raise the  
347 concentration of airborne viruses detected. The presence of these larger aggregated particles in  
348 the liquid sample can also cause large differences in viral concentrations between aliquots (see  
349 c2-like phages in Table 3). Our attempts to reduce these variations consisted of purifying the viral  
350 DNA with commercial kits and exposing the samples to sonication (data not shown). However,

351 viral DNA purification lowered the concentrations of DNA and led to the underestimation of the  
352 viral load in the air sample while sonication had no effect on the sample variability (data not  
353 shown). This inherent variability may be due to the variation of the concentrations of airborne  
354 viruses over the course of a day reflected by the short sampling period of the Coriolis. A sampler  
355 that slowly collects its sample, like the NIOSH sampler or PC and PTFE filters, likely provides a  
356 more representative evaluation of the airborne viral concentration over the course of a day.

357 In conclusion, various types of samplers were successfully used to collect airborne  
358 viruses, but the NIOSH sampler was the most efficient. Most samplers detected concentrations of  
359 at least  $10^3$  genomes/ $m^3$  of air for both the lactococcal 936-and the c2-phage groups. The NIOSH  
360 sampler results indicate that a significant portion of the airborne phages was bound to small  
361 particles ( $< 2.1 \mu m$ ). Since these smaller particles can remain airborne for longer periods of time  
362 and are influenced by air movements, it is likely that they can be carried far away from their  
363 aerosolization source. Although the dynamics of airborne viral transmission are poorly  
364 understood (29), appropriate ventilation practices should reduce airborne dissemination. Finally,  
365 a qPCR protocol was effectively adapted to detect lactococcal phages. However, it is not known  
366 whether these phages were active or inactive, or whether they were inactivated by the  
367 sampling/elution procedure. The detection level and the limit of detection are the most important  
368 characteristics to consider when choosing a sampler for field studies.

369

370

371

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

372

373           We are grateful to M. Lamoureux and J. Monast for their collaborative work in cheese  
374 factories. We wish to thank S. Simard for his assistance with statistical analysis and D. Tremblay  
375 for her technical assistance. C. Duchaine and S. Moineau received funding from the Natural  
376 Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC). C. Duchaine is also the  
377 recipient of an FRSQ Junior 2 scholarship and of a CCHSA Time release program and is a  
378 member of the FRSQ respiratory health network. This work was funded by a joint grant from  
379 FQRNT-NOVALAIT-MAPAQ and Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. The findings and  
380 conclusions in this report are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the views of  
381 the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health.

382

**References**

383

1. **Atamer, Z., J. Dietrich, M. Müller-Merbach, H. Neve, K.J. Heller, and J. Hinrichs.**

384

2009. Screening for and characterization of *Lactococcus lactis* bacteriophages with high

385

thermal resistance. Intern. Dairy J. 19 :228–235.

386

2. **Bertin Technologies.** Coriolis Brochure. Bertin Technologies, Montigny-le-Bretonneux,

387

France

388

3. **Binetti, A.G., M.L. Capra, M.A. Alvarez, and J.A. Reinheimer.** 2008. PCR method for

389

detection and identification of *Lactobacillus casei/paracasei* bacteriophages in dairy

390

products. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 124:147-153.

391

4. **Bissonnette, F., S. Labrie, H. Deveau, M. Lamoureux, and S. Moineau.** 2000.

392

Characterization of mesophilic mixed starter cultures used for the manufacture of aged

393

cheddar cheese. J. Dairy Sci. 83:620-627.

394

5. **Blachere, F. M., W. G. Lindsley, T. A. Pearce, S. E. Anderson, M. Fisher, R. Khakoo,**

395

**B. J. Meade, O. Lander, S. Davis, R. E. Thewlis, I. Celik, B. T. Chen, and D. H.**

396

**Beezhold.** 2009. Measurement of airborne influenza virus in a hospital emergency

397

department. Clin. Infect. Dis. 48:438-440.

398

6. **Burton, N.C., S.A. Grinshpun, T. Reponen.** 2007. Physical collection efficiency of

399

filter materials for bacteria and viruses. Ann Occup Hyg 51:143-151.

400

7. **Chandry, P. S., S. C. Moore, J. D. Boyce, B. E. Davidson, and A. J. Hillier.** 1997.

401

Analysis of the DNA sequence, gene expression, origin of replication and modular

402

structure of the *Lactococcus lactis* lytic bacteriophage sk1. Mol. Microbiol. 26:49-64.

- 403 8. **Crutz-Le Coq, A. M., B. Cesselin, J. Commissaire, and J. Anba.** 2002. Sequence  
404 analysis of the lactococcal bacteriophage bIL170: insights into structural proteins and  
405 HNH endonucleases in dairy phages. *Microbiology* 148:985-1001.
- 406 9. **del Rio, B., AG. Binetti, M.C. Martín, M. Fernández, A.H. Magadán, and M.A.**  
407 **Alvarez.** 2007. Multiplex PCR for the detection and identification of dairy bacteriophages  
408 in milk. *Food Microbiol.* 24:75-81.
- 409 10. **del Rio, B., M.C. Martín, N. Martínez, A.H. Magadán, and M.A. Alvarez.** 2008.  
410 Multiplex fast real-time PCR for quantitative detection and identification of cos- and pac-  
411 type *Streptococcus thermophilus* bacteriophages. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 74:4779-  
412 4781.
- 413 11. **Deveau, H., S. J. Labrie, M. C. Chopin, and S. Moineau.** 2006. Biodiversity and  
414 classification of lactococcal phages. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 72:4338-4346.
- 415 12. **Dupont, K., F. K. Vogensen, and J. Josephsen.** 2005. Detection of lactococcal 936-  
416 species bacteriophages in whey by magnetic capture hybridization PCR targeting a  
417 variable region of receptor-binding protein genes. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 98:1001-1009.
- 418 13. **Emond, E., and S. Moineau.** 2007. Bacteriophages and food fermentations. *In:*  
419 *Bacteriophage: Genetics and Molecular Biology.* S. McGrath and D. van Sinderen (eds.).  
420 Horizon Scientific Press/Caister Academic Press. p. 93-124.
- 421 14. **Hejnowicz, M. S., M. Golebiewski, and J. Bardowski.** 2009. Analysis of the complete  
422 genome sequence of the lactococcal bacteriophage bIBB29. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.*  
423 131:52-61.
- 424 15. **Hinrichs, J.** 2001. Incorporation of whey proteins in cheese. *Intern. Dairy J.* 11:495-503.
- 425 16. **Josephsen, J., N. Andersen, H. Behrndt, E. Brandsborg, G. Christiansen, S. Hansen,**

- 426           **and E. W. Nielsen.** 1994. An ecological study of lytic bacteriophages in *Lactococcus*  
427           *lactis* subsp. *cremoris* isolated in a cheese plant over a five year period. *Int. Dairy J.*  
428           4:123-140.
- 429       17. **Labrie, S., and S. Moineau.** 2000. Multiplex PCR for detection and identification of  
430           lactococcal bacteriophages. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 66:987-994.
- 431       18. **Labrie, S. J., and S. Moineau.** 2007. Abortive infection mechanisms and prophage  
432           sequences significantly influence the genetic makeup of emerging lytic lactococcal  
433           phages. *J. Bacteriol.* 189:1482-1487.
- 434       19. **Lee K.W. and M. Ramamurthi.** 1993. Filter Collection, p. 179-205. *In* K. Willeke and  
435           P.A. Baron (eds.), *Aerosol measurement: principles, techniques, and applications.* John  
436           Wiley and Sons, Inc. New York.
- 437       20. **Lubbers, M. W., N. R. Waterfield, T. P. Beresford, R. W. Le Page, and A. W. Jarvis.**  
438           1995. Sequencing and analysis of the prolate-headed lactococcal bacteriophage c2  
439           genome and identification of the structural genes. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 61:4349-  
440           4356
- 441       21. **Madera, C., C. Monjardin, and J. E. Suarez.** 2004. Milk contamination and resistance  
442           to processing conditions determine the fate of *Lactococcus lactis* bacteriophages in  
443           dairies. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 70:7365-7371.
- 444       22. **Mahony, J., H. Deveau, S. Mc Grath, M. Ventura, C. Canchaya, S. Moineau, G. F.**  
445           **Fitzgerald, and D. van Sinderen.** 2006. Sequence and comparative genomic analysis of  
446           lactococcal bacteriophages jj50, 712 and P008: evolutionary insights into the 936 phage  
447           species. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 261:253-261.

- 448 23. **McIntyre, K., H. A. Heap, G. P. Davey, and G. K. Y. Limsowtin.** 1991. The  
449 distribution of lactococcal bacteriophage in the environment of a cheese manufacturing  
450 plant. *Int. Dairy J.* 1:183-197.
- 451 24. **Mistry, V. V., and F. V. Kosikowski.** 1986. Influence of milk ultrafiltration on  
452 bacteriophages of lactic acid bacteria. *J. Dairy Sci.* **69**:2577-2582.
- 453 25. **Moineau, S., M. Borkaev, B. J. Holler, S. A. Walker, J. K. Kondo, E. R. Vedamuthu,**  
454 **and P. A. Vandenberg.** 1996. Isolation and characterization of lactococcal  
455 bacteriophages from cultured buttermilk plants in the United States. *J. Dairy Sci.*  
456 79:2104-2111.
- 457 26. **Moineau, S., J. Fortier, H. W. Ackermann, and S. Pandian.** 1992. Characterization of  
458 lactococcal bacteriophages from Quebec cheese plants. *Can. J. Microbiol.* 38:875–882.
- 459 27. **Moineau, S. and C. Lévesque.** 2005. Control of bacteriophages in industrial fermentation.  
460 *In: Bacteriophages: Biology and Applications.* E. Kutter and A. Sulakvelidze (eds.). CRC  
461 Press, p. 285-296.
- 462 28. **Moineau, S., D. Tremblay, and S. Labrie.** 2002. Phages of lactic acid bacteria: From  
463 genomics to industrial applications - Dairy microbiologists seek new ways to protect  
464 milk-fermenting microorganisms against damaging phages. *ASM News* 68:388-393.
- 465 29. **Morawska, L.** 2006. Droplet fate in indoor environments, or can we prevent the spread of  
466 infection? *Indoor Air* 16:335-347.
- 467 30. **Neve, H., A. Berger, and K. J. Heller.** 1995. A method for detecting and enumerating  
468 airborne virulent bacteriophage of dairy starter cultures. *Kieler Milchw Forsch* 47:193-  
469 207.

- 470 31. Neve, H., U. Kemper, A. Geis, and K. J. Heller. 1994. Monitoring and characterization  
471 of lactococcal bacteriophages in a dairy plant. *Kieler Milchw Forsch* 46:167-178.
- 472 32. Neve, H., A. Laborius, and K. J. Heller. 2003. Testing of the applicability of battery-  
473 powered portable microbial air samplers for detection and enumeration of airborne  
474 *Lactococcus lactis* dairy bacteriophages. *Kieler Milchw. Forsch.* 55:301-315.
- 475 33. Quiberoni, A., D. Tremblay, H.-W. Ackermann, S. Moineau, and J. A. Reinheimer.  
476 2006. Diversity of *Streptococcus thermophilus* phages in a large-production cheese  
477 factory in Argentina. *J. Dairy Sci.* 89:3791-3799.
- 478 34. Raiski, A., and N. Belyasova. 2009. Biodiversity of *Lactococcus lactis* bacteriophages in  
479 the Republic of Belarus. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 130:1-5.
- 480 35. Rousseau, G. M., and S. Moineau. 2009. Evolution of *Lactococcus lactis* phages within  
481 a cheese factory. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 75:5336-5344.
- 482 36. Schouler, C., S. D. Ehrlich, and M.-C. Chopin. 1994. Sequence and organization of the  
483 lactococcal prolate-headed bIL67 phage genome. *Microbiology.* 140:3061-3069.
- 484 37. SKC Inc.. BioSampler Operating Instructions. Form #37084 Rev 1008. SKC Inc., Eighty  
485 Four, PA.
- 486 38. Szczepańska, A.K., M.S. Hejnowicz, P. Kołakowski, and J. Bardowski. 2007.  
487 Biodiversity of *Lactococcus lactis* bacteriophages in Polish dairy environment. *Acta*  
488 *Biochim Pol.* 54:151-158.
- 489 39. Suárez, V., S. Moineau, J. Reinheimer, and A. Quiberoni. 2008. Argentinean  
490 *Lactococcus lactis* bacteriophages: genetic characterization and adsorption studies. *J.*  
491 *Appl. Microbiol.* 104:371-379.

- 492 40. Verreault, D., S. Moineau, and C. Duchaine. 2008. Methods for sampling of airborne  
493 viruses. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 72:413-444.
- 494 41. Verreault, D., G. M. Rousseau, L. Gendron, D. Massé, S. Moineau, and C. Duchaine.  
495 2010. Comparison of polycarbonate and polytetrafluoroethylene filters for sampling of  
496 airborne bacteriophages. *Aerosol. Sci. Tech.* 44:197-201.
- 497 42. Zago, M., L. Rossetti, J. Reinheimer, D. Carminati, and G. Giraffa. 2008. Detection  
498 and identification of *Lactobacillus helveticus* bacteriophages by PCR. *J. Dairy Res.*  
499 75:196-201.
- 500

1 Table 1: Sampler descriptions

<b>Sampler</b>	<b>Principle</b>	<b>Sampling rate used (L/min)</b>	<b>Documented physical collection efficiency</b>	<b>Reference</b>
<b>Polycarbonate (PC) filters (0.4 <math>\mu\text{m}</math> pore size)</b>	Filtration	2	78 to 99.99% for particles 0.035 to 1 $\mu\text{m}$ . (Data obtained with similar filter from different manufacturer)	(19)
<b>Polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) membrane filters (0.3 <math>\mu\text{m}</math> pore size)</b>	Filtration	2	More than 96% efficiency for particles 10 to 900 nm	(6)
<b>BioSampler</b>	Liquid impaction	12.5	>1.0 $\mu\text{m}$ ; close to 100% 0.5 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 90%	(37)
<b>Coriolis cyclone sampler</b>	Liquid impaction	300	0.8 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 62% 1.6 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 70% 2.4 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 80% 4.4 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 100% 16 $\mu\text{m}$ ; 109%	(2)
<b>NIOSH two-stage bioaerosol cyclone (BC 251) personal samplers</b>	Dry surface impaction (stages 1 and 2) and filtration (stage 3)	10	First stage 50% cut-off: 2.1 $\mu\text{m}$ Second stage 50% cut-off: 0.41 $\mu\text{m}$	Product data sheet

3 Table 2: Primer specificity for c2 and 936 detection and quantification.

Phage isolates from cheese factories	Group	936		c2	
		qPCR	Gel	qPCR	Gel
DM1	936	+	+	-	-
DM2	936	+	+	-	-
DM3	936	+	+	-	-
DM4	936	+	+	-	-
DM5	936	+	+	-	-
DM6	936	+	+	-	-
DM7	936	+	+	-	-
DM8	936	+	+	-	-
DM9	936	+	+	-	-
DM10	936	+	+	-	-
DM11	936	+	+	-	-
DM12	936	+	+	-	-
DM13	936	+	+	-	-
JG4	936	+	+	-	-
JG9	936	+	+	-	-
JG10	936	+	+	-	-
GL1	936	+	+	-	-
GL3	936	+	+	-	-
GL7	936	+	+	-	-
GL8	936	+	+	-	-
GL9	936	+	+	-	-

GL10	936	+	+	-	-
GL11	936	+	+	-	-
LS13	c2	-	-	+	+
CB17	c2	-	-	+	+
CB27	c2	-	-	+	+
GR3	c2	-	-	+	+
GR4	c2	-	-	+	+
GR6	c2	-	-	+	+
bIL67	c2	-	-	+	+
GR2	P335	-	-	-	-

---

4 Table 3: Airborne concentrations of 936 and c2 phages in a cheese factory.

Sampler	936			c2		
	Positive/ total assays <sup>a</sup>	Median concentration (1st quartile; 3rd quartile) <sup>b</sup>	LOD <sup>c</sup>	Positive/ total assays <sup>a</sup>	Median concentration (1st quartile; 3rd quartile) <sup>b</sup>	LOD <sup>c</sup>
NIOSH (stage 1)	12/12 (100%)	5346 (2494; 6010)	10	10/12 (83%)	162 (124; 208)	50
NIOSH (stage 2)	11/12 (92%)	280 (159; 449)	10	5/12 (42%)	223 (139; 465)	50
Coriolis	43/52 (83%)	580 (249; 2905)	62	32/52 (62%)	1848 (792; 31077)	318
PC filter	15/18 (83%)	2399 (1372; 3483)	492	5/18 (28%)	5377 (3562; 5595)	2523
PTFE filter	14/18 (78%)	1538 (1271; 2093)	492	5/18 (28%)	3378 (3232; 3917)	2523
BioSampler	1/18 (6%)	27903	6986	3/18 (17%)	51750 (44905; 66148)	35821

5 <sup>a</sup> Number of positive qPCR assays versus the total number of assays (% positive samples).

6 <sup>b</sup> Median concentration of genomes/m<sup>3</sup> of air taking only positive samples into account.

7 <sup>c</sup> Limit of detection of viral genomes/m<sup>3</sup> of air by qPCR.

8 Table 4: Estimated concentrations of 936-like and c2-like genomes per cm<sup>2</sup> of a swabbed surface.

Surface description	936		c2	
	Genomes/cm <sup>2</sup>	Positive/total assays <sup>a</sup>	Genomes/cm <sup>2</sup>	Positive/total assays <sup>a</sup>
Door handle	9106 ± 789	3/3	869 ± 69	3/3
Rough floor	6115 ± 785	3/3	1113 ± 120	3/3
Top of paper towel dispenser	6079 ± 800	3/3	458 ± 109	3/3
Cleaning material	1854 ± 271	3/3	3138 ± 449	3/3
Smooth floor	448 ± 145	15/15	564 ± 403	9/10
Wall	407 ± 169	3/3	945 ± 66	3/3
Push for hand sanitizer	266 ± 126	3/3	0	0/3
Office table	60 ± 28	3/3	83 ± 41	3/3
Top of electrical panel	53	1/4	0	0/5
Top of stainless pipe	30 ± 7	3/3	260 ± 59	3/3
Stair ramp	11 ± 10	4/6	67 ± 44	3/6
Top of closed tank	3 ± 1	3/3	12 ± 2	3/3
Vertical panel	2	1/3	9	1/3
Vertical surface (electrical)	0	0/3	43 ± 5	3/3

9 <sup>a</sup> Number of positive qPCR assays versus the total number of assays.

- 1 Figure 1: Mean size distribution of airborne particles in a cheese factory shown according to the
- 2 frequency of particle count in each channel of the APC. Error bars represent standard deviations.
- 3

